

**EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL****CABINET REPORT – 31 MARCH 2021****Report by Depute Chief Executive - Safer Communities**

---

**STRATEGIC TRANSPORT PROJECTS REVIEW (STPR2) UPDATE**

---

**PURPOSE OF REPORT**

1. The purpose of this report is to provide an update on Transport Scotland's second Strategic Transport Projects Review (STPR2), and approve the consultation response to the 'Initial Appraisal: Case for Change Ayrshire & Arran Region' and 'STPR2: Update and Phase 1 Recommendations' reports published on 3 February 2021.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

2. **It is recommended that Cabinet:**
  - i. **Notes the publication of the STPR2 Case for Change Report for Ayrshire & Arran, and the STPR2: Update and Phase 1 Recommendations report;**
  - ii. **Agrees that the consultation responses included at Appendix 1 to both documents is submitted to Transport Scotland; and**
  - iii. **Otherwise notes the contents of the report.**

**BACKGROUND**

3. The original STPR was published in 2009. It included 29 recommendations for strategic road and rail improvements such as the Queensferry Crossing, A9 improvements, rail infrastructure improvements and various park and rides.
4. STPR2 is being led by Transport Scotland and will inform transport investment in Scotland for the next 20 years. It is intended to help deliver the vision, priorities and outcomes of the second National Transport Strategy (NTS2), and will complement others such as the Infrastructure Investment Plan, National Planning Framework 4, and Climate Change Plan update.
5. STPR2 has a wider scope than the original STPR and is predicated on the Sustainable Travel Hierarchy in NTS2 which promotes walking, wheeling, cycling, public transport and shared transport options in preference to individual use of a private car.
6. Due to Covid-19, Transport Scotland has restructured the STPR2 into two phases. Phase 1 will focus on the short-term (up to 5 years) with a view to identifying interventions which can be accelerated to support a green

economic recovery from Covid-19, and also those which embed, support and extend any increase in travel by sustainable travel modes, including positive behaviour change seen during the pandemic. Phase 2 will complete the review and report in Autumn 2021, giving Scottish Ministers a programme of potential transport investment opportunities for the period 2022-2042.

### **INITIAL APPRAISAL: CASE FOR CHANGE AYRSHIRE & ARRAN REGION**

7. STPR2 is being progressed at both a national and regional level in order to appraise transport problems and opportunities and the development of options in the context of place. A total of 11 regions were established for STPR2 including Ayrshire & Arran and a regional working group was established which includes representatives from:
- Transport Scotland
  - Jacobs/Aecom transport consultants
  - Ayrshire Roads Alliance
  - 3 Councils' Planning Policy teams
  - Ayrshire Growth Deal
  - Strathclyde Partnership for Transport

### **Stakeholder Engagement**

8. In addition to the Working Group meetings, local problems and opportunities were identified through a number of stakeholder engagement events:
- Problems and Opportunities workshops held in Ardrossan and Kilmarnock with regional stakeholders in June 2019.
  - Option Generation workshops held in the same locations in November 2019 to identify potential options to address the identified problems and opportunities.
  - Structured Interviews undertaken with stakeholders, including senior officers across the 3 Ayrshire Local Authorities, Regional Transport Partnership officers and other organisations in the region.
  - An Elected Members Briefing held in Irvine in January 2020 and attended by around 30 Elected Members and Senior Officers.
  - An Online Survey carried out between 2nd December 2019 and 10th January 2020 for the public and organisations to provide their views on transport issues and challenges in their day to day journeys.

### **Problems and Opportunities Summary**

9. The transport problems and opportunities in the Ayrshire & Arran region were informed through data analysis, stakeholder engagement and policy review. The key themes identified are:
- Active Travel Facilities and Safety: Mode of travel to work by bicycle and foot is lower in the region compared to the Scottish average. This may in part be due to a lack of active travel facilities, including segregated cycle

infrastructure for commuting purposes and on-board bike carrying facilities on trains and buses. Safety was also highlighted as a concern.

- **Accessibility:** There are large areas of Ayrshire where there is limited access to public transport, particularly in rural areas, although bus revenue support is out of scope for STPR2. Poor accessibility restricts people's access to key services, including employment, education and healthcare.
- **Connectivity and Journey Times:** This has primarily been highlighted as a problem between Ayrshire and the M74 (via the non-trunk A70 and A71) and south of Ayr to access the ports at Cairnryan via the A77. Long journey times were noted to impact the economic competitiveness of the region.
- **Resilience:** In the event of A77 route closure the diversionary route has been noted to be long and sub-standard for the volume and type of vehicles using it (e.g. HGVs).
- **Capacity constraints and congestion at the Bellfield Interchange,**
- **Frequency and Fragility of Public Transport:** Limited public transport coverage prevents access to services and can lead to forced car ownership. There is limited integration between public transport, particularly in rural areas, and limited interconnectivity between bus, rail and ferries with low frequency and limited operating hours. Bus patronage has fallen in recent years and bus mileage, bus connectivity and bus quality have been cited as contributory factors to this decline.
- **Transport Poverty and Affordability:** Transport expenditure and poverty is generally higher in rural parts of the region. The cost of bus travel in the region was noted to be high compared to car (and taxi) and there is a perceived lack of funding to encourage modal shift.
- **There are opportunities associated with:** Economic development, particularly in relation to the Ayrshire Growth Deal; tourism, including, though not limited to, active travel tourism; journey time reduction, journey quality and improved connectivity; travel planning, behaviour change and low carbon, such as improving digital connectivity and electric vehicle infrastructure; and improving route resilience.

### **Option Generation, Sifting and Development**

- 10.** Transport Scotland generated a long list of initial transport options across all modes. All of these ideas/suggestions/options were collated and generated 880 options. Options that required further definition were developed, and similar options were consolidated. Following the option cleaning exercise, 243 options were retained in the long list of interventions to be sifted specific to the Ayrshire and Arran Region.
- 11.** Each of the options included in the long list were then assessed using an option sifting methodology developed to drive consistency in the sifting of options across STPR2. Based on the methodology, options were either:
  - Sifted in for further consideration; or
  - Sifted out from the process. If appropriate, these options will be passed to other areas of Transport Scotland / Scottish Government, or the

appropriate local/regional transport authorities and partnerships (through the RTWGs) for consideration outwith STPR2.

### **Draft Options Pack**

12. The Ayrshire & Arran Working Group was consulted on an 'Options Pack' on 10 November 2020. The Head of Roads at ARA responded on behalf of the Working Group on 26 November 2020 with a number of queries and concerns relating to the process and the options that were sifted out. These concerns included:
- Clarity sought on criteria for defining projects as either in scope and out of scope;
  - Clarity sought on the sifting process;
  - Concern that A70 and A71 routes were denoted as out of scope without clarity on why they were considered out of scope;
  - Clarity sought on what criteria was to be used to assess the selection of options from the long list to the short list.
13. The 'Initial Appraisal: Case for Change Ayrshire & Arran Region' was published on 3 February 2021 together with the other regional case for change reports and the National Case for Change report.

### **Options Sifted Out**

14. A full list of options that were sifted out across all regions and at a national level is provided as an Appendix to the National Case for Change. The 105 options sifted out in the Ayrshire and Arran and Transport Scotland's rationale for sifting them out are shown [here](#) (pages 71 – 87).

### **Examples of Options Sifted out**

15. The following is a sample of options sifted out and Transport Scotland's rationale for doing so:
- Cheaper/subsidised bus fares and cheaper rail fares for all users (out of scope as it relates to concessionary fares);
  - Ayrshire inter-connected core bus route network with half-hourly frequency (out of scope as it requires revenue funding);
  - Upgrades to A70, A71 & A736 (improve carriageway standard, realignment, straightening) (option out of scope as it relates to a local roads);
  - Upgrade A77 to motorway standard as far as Prestwick (option sifted out as does not address regional problems/opportunities)

### **Options Sifted In**

16. Following the sifting exercise 138 options specific to the Ayrshire and Arran Region have been retained for further appraisal and can be found [here](#) (pages 48 – 65)

## Examples of Options Sifted In

17. The following is a sample of options sifted in for further appraisal:
- Provision of a cycle/footpath network which follows main roads to connect settlements
  - Introduce bus priority lanes on the A77/M77 into Glasgow
  - Electrification of Kilmarnock rail line
  - Re-open Ayr-Mauchline rail line for passenger services
  - New rail stations at Kilmarnock North-West, Kilmarnock East, Kilmarnock South, & Hurlford
  - Increased park and ride spaces for bus and rail
  - Upgrade of Bellfield Interchange
  - Mauchline Bypass

## STPR2: UPDATE AND PHASE 1 RECOMMENDATIONS

18. As mentioned at paragraph 6, due to Covid-19 Transport Scotland has restructured the STPR2 into two phases. Phase 1 will focus on the short-term (up to 5 years) with a view to identifying interventions which can be accelerated to support a green economic recovery from Covid-19. The outcome of STPR2 Phase 1 is that twenty interventions are recommended for early progression. Transport Scotland emphasise that the support of partners will be essential in taking these forward and for delivery. Grouped under eight themes, the twenty interventions are noted in Table 1 below:

**Table 1: STPR2 Phase 1 themes and Interventions**

| Theme                                                                               | Proposed Interventions                                                                                                                                                     |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Supporting smart and sustainable travel across Scotland                             | 1. Development and delivery of Active Freeways<br>2. Expansion of 20mph zones<br>3. Influencing travel choices                                                             |
| Creating Smart and sustainable towns and villages                                   | 4. Transport's contribution towards place-making principals in neighbourhoods.<br>5. Guidance and framework for delivering mobility hubs                                   |
| Improving accessibility in rural, island and peripheral areas and vulnerable groups | 6. Investment in Demand Responsive Transport and Mobility As a Service                                                                                                     |
| Transforming Cities                                                                 | 7. Reallocation of road space for active travel<br>8. Enhancing facilities at major rail stations<br>9. Development of Glasgow Metro and Edinburgh Mass Transit strategies |
| Enhancing public transport provision                                                | 10. Reallocation of road space for buses<br>11. Supporting integrated journeys at ferry terminals<br>12. Infrastructure to provide access for all at rail stations         |

| Theme                                                              | Proposed Interventions                                                                                                                                    |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Supporting transition to low-carbon transport                      | 13. Investment in low carbon and alternative fuel systems<br>14. Delivery of Rail Decarbonisation Programme (Phase 1)                                     |
| Supporting a viable freight industry                               | 15. Strategy for improving rest and welfare facilities for hauliers<br>16. Infrastructure to encourage rail freight                                       |
| Enhancing safety and resilience on the strategic transport network | 17. Investment in the trunk road network asset<br>18. Access to Argyll and Bute (A83)<br>19. Investment in ferries and ports<br>20. Speed Management Plan |

19. Transport Scotland propose that detailed delivery plans are developed for each of the 20 interventions, including a programme, with a focus on the next 5 years, along with an operational plan outlining the specific roles and responsibilities of those organisations responsible for taking the intervention forward. The Phase 1 recommendations will also be included with the overall appraisal of the final STPR2 package of interventions.

### **Stage 2 – Appraisal (Spring – Summer 2021)**

20. The next stage of the process is for the sifted options to be combined into packages and appraised against the Transport Planning Objectives and against wider Scottish Transport Appraisal Guidance (STAG) criteria and deliverability. This includes feasibility, affordability and public acceptability.
21. Further detailed assessment will be undertaken to produce a final short list of proposed interventions which will be reported in STPR2 Phase 2 and will complete the Review.

### **Approvals and Reporting (Autumn 2021)**

22. Drafts of the STPR2 Reports associated with Phase 2 and a proposed delivery plan are programmed to be finalised for approval by Scottish Ministers during Autumn 2021. The final draft reports are planned to be published, providing stakeholders, including the general public, with the opportunity to comment before the end of 2021.

### **Consultation Response to Current STPR2 Reports**

23. Transport Scotland has invited comments on the ‘Initial Appraisal: Case for Change Ayrshire & Arran Region’ and ‘STPR2: Update and Phase 1 Recommendations’ reports published on 3 February 2021. A questionnaire has been issued with responses due by 31 March 2021. The proposed ARA response to be submitted on behalf of East and South Ayrshire Councils is attached at Appendix 1.
24. The consultation response reflects comments made by the three Ayrshire Council Chief Executives in a letter to the Cabinet Secretary for Transport,

Infrastructure and Connectivity on 11 January 2021. The letter made the following points:

- Acknowledging the need for STPR2 to focus on a green recovery from Covid-19, but also emphasising the fundamental view that economic recovery needs to be the key driver in STPR2 development.
- Expressing concern that local roads are scoped out unless providing access to a 'major port' or NPF4 site and that this removes any necessary infrastructure investment from the Ayrshire Growth Deal sites.
- Concern that there is a lack of alignment between NPF4 and STPR2
- Concern about the lack of alignment between Phases 1 and 2 and Ayrshire Growth Deal Projects.
- Concern that while Transport Scotland have advised that although the upgrade to the Bellfield Interchange is included in Phase 2 they expect the cost of the Transport Appraisal to be funded by the Council, and that this runs counter to the funding mechanism for every other strategic transport project and is not acceptable, particularly in circumstances where investment would benefit at least three council areas and possibly four.

#### **POLICY/COMMUNITY PLANNING IMPLICATIONS**

25. STPR2 is being undertaken in accordance with the second National Transport Strategy.

#### **LEGAL IMPLICATIONS**

26. There are no direct legal implications arising from this report.

#### **HUMAN RESOURCES IMPLICATIONS**

27. There are no human resource implications arising from the report at the present time. However, should additional funding be made available for active travel measures this will have a staff resource implication for ARA.

#### **FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

28. There are no direct financial implications arising from this report at the current time.

#### **RISK MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS**

29. There are no risk implications directly arising from this report.

#### **TRANSFORMATION**

30. The outcomes from STPR2 should align with the design principles stated in the "Transformation Strategy 2017-2022" - "Maximum value for our communities", by ensuring that safe and sustainable transport options are available to communities.

## EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

31. An Equality Impact Assessment will be undertaken by Transport Scotland in parallel with STPR2.

KC

15/03/21

### Background Papers

All STPR2 documents can be found on the Transport Scotland website at:

<https://www.transport.gov.scot/our-approach/strategy/strategic-transport-projects-review-2/#overview>

### Appendices

Appendix 1 – Response to Consultation

**Person to contact:** Kevin Braidwood, Interim Head of Roads - Ayrshire Roads Alliance

**Tel No.** 01563 503164

**E-mail:** [Kevin.Braidwood@ayrshireroadsalliance.org](mailto:Kevin.Braidwood@ayrshireroadsalliance.org)

**Implementation officer:** Kevin Braidwood, Interim Head of Roads - Ayrshire Roads Alliance

**Tel No.** 01563 503164

**E-mail:** [kevin.braidwood@ayrshireroadsalliance.org](mailto:kevin.braidwood@ayrshireroadsalliance.org)



## APPENDIX 1 – ARA RESPONSE TO CONSULTATION

### STPR2 Comments Forms

#### Privacy Statement:

##### **STPR2: Update and Phase 1 Recommendations report:**

This comments form seeks to understand your views on the **eight Phase 1 themes and associated Phase 1 interventions** within the **STPR2: Update and Phase 1 Recommendations report**. We recommend that you review the material within the report prior to you providing comments. The form should take about 10 minutes to complete and all responses are anonymous.

The closing date for comments is midnight on 31 March 2021.

| Demographic Questions                                                 |                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1                                                                     |                                            | <p>Are you responding as an individual or an organisation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Individual</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| <b>Comments Form STPR2: Update and Phase 1 Recommendations report</b> |                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 5                                                                     |                                            | <p>If responding as an organisation, what is the name of your organisation?</p> <p><b>Ayrshire Roads Alliance (on behalf of East Ayrshire Council and South Ayrshire Council)</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 3                                                                     |                                            | <p>Please indicate which category best describes your organisation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Third Sector or Community group</li> <li>▪ Transport Operator</li> <li>▪ Business Organisation</li> <li>▪ Community Council</li> <li>▪ Local Authority</li> <li>▪ Regional Transport Partnership</li> <li>▪ <b>Other Public Sector</b></li> <li>▪ Academia / Education</li> <li>▪ Other (please specify)</li> </ul> |
| 4                                                                     | Only for those responding as an individual | <p>Which of these age groups are you in?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 16-17</li> <li>▪ 18-24</li> <li>▪ 25- 34</li> <li>▪ 35-44</li> <li>▪ 45-54</li> <li>▪ 55+</li> <li>▪ Prefer not to say</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                              |

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    | <p>investment priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Strongly agree</li> <li>▪ <b>Agree</b></li> <li>▪ Neither agree nor disagree</li> <li>▪ Disagree</li> <li>▪ Strongly disagree</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 6  | <p>Do you feel the themes appropriately address challenges and opportunities described within the report?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <b>Yes</b></li> <li>▪ No</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 6b | <p>Please use the space below to provide any further comments on the challenges and opportunities described within the report:</p> <p><b>We recognise the need to support the commitments and targets in the Climate Change Plan and that there should be an improved focus on active and sustainable transport transport and public transport. However in many more rural areas there are fewer options to adapt and travel by car is a necessity. This needs to be recognised in STPR2 with a corresponding commitment to necessary roads based schemes particularly where these are required to deal with existing problems and capacity issues which adversely affect economic recovery and future economic prospects in Ayrshire.</b></p> |
| 7  | <p>Do you feel that the Phase 1 interventions associated with the eight themes support the priorities and outcomes of the National Transport Strategy?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <b>Strongly agree</b></li> <li>▪ Agree</li> <li>▪ Neither agree nor disagree</li> <li>▪ Disagree</li> <li>▪ Strongly disagree</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 8  | <p>Please use the space below to provide any further comments that you wish to make on the eight themes.</p> <p><b>The themes are consistent with NTS2 and climate change commitments.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 9  | <p>How well do the Phase 1 interventions respond to the uncertainty in travel demand and behaviour that we face in the short term due to COVID-19?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <b>Very well</b></li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |

|    |  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|----|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Well</li> <li>▪ Don't know / No opinion</li> <li>▪ Poorly</li> <li>▪ Very poorly</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 10 |  | <p>How well do the Phase 1 interventions support Scotland's recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic in the short-term?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Very well</li> <li>▪ <b>Well</b></li> <li>▪ Don't know / No opinion</li> <li>▪ Poorly</li> <li>▪ Very poorly</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 11 |  | <p>Please use the space below to highlight the Phase 1 themes and interventions, that you particularly support:</p> <p><b>Intervention 5 for the framework for delivering mobility hubs is welcomed as it offers an integrated approach to transport by improving links between transport modes, supports active travel, and providing seamless travel opportunities.</b></p> <p><b>Intervention 6 to improve accessibility in rural, island and peripheral areas for vulnerable groups is welcomed as it recognises the transport challenges faced in lower density suburban areas and in rural areas. However, capital funding will not provide long-term sustainability of services which can only be achieved through ongoing revenue support.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 12 |  | <p>Please use the space below to highlight where you disagree with any the Phase 1 themes or interventions.</p> <p><b>Some interventions, such as 'Intervention 4 - Transport's contributions towards placemaking principles in neighbourhoods', which talks of reallocation of road spaces and removal of rationalisation of on-street parking are more suited to larger or city neighbourhoods. In more rural areas which by necessity depend much more on the car a balance needs to be struck so that access is available for all modes.</b></p> <p><b>There is no specific intervention for roads investment projects other than Inventions 17 &amp; 18 which specifically relate to trunk roads but only in terms of improving safety and resilience. With local roads out of scope in STPR2 there will be no improvement to the vast majority of the road network condition throughout Ayrshire and the rest of the country.</b></p> <p><b>While we expect that necessary road schemes will form part of Phase 2 we are concerned that many important roads schemes will miss out due to an assessment framework heavily weighted in favour of sustainable and active travel.</b></p> |

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 13 | <p>Please use the space below to provide any other comments you wish to make on the STPR2: Update and Phase 1 Recommendations report.</p> <p><b>Whilst we acknowledge the need for STPR2 to focus on a green recovery from Covid-19, our fundamental view is that economic recovery needs to continue to be the key driver in STPR2 development.</b></p> <p><b>It is unclear how funds will be allocated to local authorities to take forward projects. Clarity is required on whether Councils will be awarded additional ring-fenced block grant funding to take forward schemes or if they will require to submit challenge funding bids for projects. We consider that funding should be awarded directly to local authorities rather than through third parties and charities as at present.</b></p> <p><b>It will be important that non-city authorities are not penalised by virtue of lower density populations and that criteria for awarding funding is equitable, particularly given that Interventions 7, 8 &amp; 9 are only applicable to cities.</b></p> <p><b>Phase 1 covers a five year period. However it must be recognised that many infrastructure projects can take longer to implement, particularly if there are planning and land issues.</b></p> <p><b>It will be important that the revenue funding implications arising from additional infrastructure investment is recognised and that additional funding is awarded to Councils for that purpose. Unless revenue support is provided it is unlikely that public transport use will grow outwith the major population centres.</b></p> |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

**STPR2 Transport Options Questions:**

This comments form is aimed at capturing your views on the **STPR2 Transport Options outlined within the Case for Change document**. It also seeks views on the challenges and opportunities related to COVID-19 as well as the STPR2 engagement process to date. We recommend that you review the material within the report prior to you providing comments. The form should take around 10 minutes to complete and all responses are anonymous.

The closing date for comments is midnight 31 March 2021.

| Demographic Questions |                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|-----------------------|--------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1                     |                                            | <p>Are you responding as an individual or an organisation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Individual</li> <li>▪ <b>Organisation</b></li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 2                     | (for those responding as an organisation)  | <p>If responding as an organisation, what is the name of your organisation?</p> <p><b>Ayrshire Roads Alliance (on behalf of East Ayrshire Council and South Ayrshire Council)</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 3                     | (for those responding as an organisation)  | <p>Please indicate which category best describes your organisation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Third Sector or Community group</li> <li>▪ Transport Operator</li> <li>▪ Business Organisation</li> <li>▪ Community Council</li> <li>▪ Local Authority</li> <li>▪ Regional Transport Partnership</li> <li>▪ <b>Other Public Sector</b></li> <li>▪ Academia / Education</li> <li>▪ Other (please specify)</li> </ul> |
| 4                     | Only for those responding as an individual | <p>Which of these age groups are you in?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 16-17</li> <li>▪ 18-24</li> <li>▪ 25- 34</li> <li>▪ 35-44</li> <li>▪ 45-54</li> <li>▪ 55+</li> <li>▪ Prefer not to say</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                              |

| Comments Form STPR2 Case for Change and Transport Options |  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|-----------------------------------------------------------|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                           |  | <p>Which of the Case for Change reports have you read prior to providing comments? Tick as many that apply:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Argyll &amp; Bute Case for Change</li> <li>▪ <b>Ayrshire &amp; Arran Case for Change</b></li> <li>▪ Edinburgh &amp; the South East Case for Change</li> <li>▪ Forth Valley Case for Change</li> <li>▪ Glasgow City Region Case for Change</li> <li>▪ Highlands &amp; Islands Case for Change</li> <li>▪ National Case for Change</li> <li>▪ Shetland Islands Case for Change</li> <li>▪ Tay Cities Case for Change</li> </ul> |
| 5                                                         |  | <p>To what extent do you agree or disagree with the following statement:</p> <p>The recommended transport options for STPR2 are strategic covering a range of modes and geographies.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Strongly agree</li> <li>▪ <b>Agree</b></li> <li>▪ Neither agree nor disagree</li> <li>▪ Disagree</li> <li>▪ Strongly disagree</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 6                                                         |  | <p>How well do you feel the transport options recommended for further consideration address the problems, opportunities and objectives for strategic transport connections in Scotland?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Very well</li> <li>▪ <b>Well</b></li> <li>▪ Don't know / No opinion</li> <li>▪ Poorly</li> <li>▪ Very Poorly</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |



|    |  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|----|--|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 7  |  | <p>Do you have any other comments on the transport options identified?</p> <p><b>We believe that there are some non-trunk roads such as the A70 and A71 routes which are strategic in nature and provide important routes to markets which should be considered within the scope of STPR2.</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 8  |  | <p>To what extent do you agree or disagree with the following statement:</p> <p>It is clear what the next steps are when considering the transport options.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Strongly agree</li> <li>▪ <b>Agree</b></li> <li>▪ Neither agree nor disagree</li> <li>▪ Disagree</li> <li>▪ Strongly disagree</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 9  |  | <p>Do you believe that the COVID-19 pandemic will bring about challenges and/or opportunities relevant to planning future transport investment through STPR2?</p> <p>Please select all that apply below (NOTE: this will only be possible for the top two in the list)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <b>Yes, challenges</b></li> <li>▪ <b>Yes, opportunities</b></li> <li>▪ No, neither challenges nor opportunities</li> <li>▪ Don't know</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                              |
| 10 |  | <p>What do you believe could be the key medium to longer-term challenges relevant to STPR2 arising from the COVID-19 pandemic on travel demand and patterns in your region / nationally?</p> <p><b>Many transport projects can take a long time to implement from feasibility through design and planning. This isn't just applicable to major roads schemes but also active travel projects where there are planning, consultation, orders and land issues to deal with. It is important that projects progress quickly so that the active travel uptake experienced can be sustained and improved upon.</b></p> |
| 11 |  | <p>What do you believe could be the key medium to longer-term opportunities relevant to STPR2 arising from the COVID-19 pandemic on travel demand and patterns in your region / nationally?</p> <p><b>The uptake in cycling and walking during lockdowns has been a positive factor and will make attitudes to active travel</b></p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |

|    |                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|----|--------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                                                  | <b>investment more favourable, though this must be balanced against the need to provide continued road investment in more rural areas where roads are essential for access and employment.</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 12 |                                                  | How well do you feel the Case for Change element of STPR2 has engaged with stakeholders and the public? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ <b>Very well</b></li> <li>▪ Well</li> <li>▪ Don't know / No opinion</li> <li>▪ Poorly</li> <li>▪ Very Poorly</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 13 |                                                  | Have you or your organisation participated in events or previous online surveys in relation to STPR2? Tick all that apply: <p><b>Workshops</b></p> <p>Online Survey</p> <p><b>Feedback forms</b></p> <p>None</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 14 |                                                  | What worked well and what could have been improved in the Case for Change stakeholder and public engagement? <p><b>The stakeholder meetings were an effective way of generating discussions and options with a range of stakeholders. The interactive 'round table' was an effective way of capturing views. Greater clarity could have been provide during the consultation stage as to what was 'in scope' and 'out of scope' for STPR2 could have been provided.</b></p>                                       |
| 15 |                                                  | Overall, has the Case for Change element of STPR2 met your or your organisation's expectations? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Yes, it has fully met my or my organisation's expectations</li> <li>▪ <b>It has met some of my or my organisation's expectations</b></li> <li>▪ No, it has not met my or my organisation's expectations</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                       |
| 16 | Answer only for if you responded to Q15 – It has | Please explain why the Case for Change element of STPR2 <b>has not</b> met all your organisation's expectations? <p><b>We do not see the rationale for local roads being scoped out unless providing direct access to a 'major port' or NPF4 site. There is concern that this removes any necessary infrastructure investment from Ayrshire Growth Deal sites. Further, we cannot see how direct access to a 'major port' can be a criteria used in determining what is in/out of scope, when no decision</b></p> |

|    |                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    | <p>met some /<br/>No, it has not<br/>my or my<br/>organisations<br/>expectations</p> | <p><b>has yet been taken by Transport Scotland on what ports are designated ‘major’ and there is no indication of when this decision will be taken.</b></p> <p><b>The A70 and A71 provide the most direct linkages between South and East Ayrshire Councils respectively and the M74 – these are key strategic routes which impact on economic growth and effective movement of goods. In addition to freight movements and economic factors, these routes also raise concerns in relation to severance and road safety within settlements located along these routes. A significant proportion of trips using these routes is strategic in nature, and it would appear counter-intuitive for these suggested projects to be sifted out of a Strategic Transport Projects Review process without clear justification.</b></p> <p><b>In the same vein, we cannot see how direct access to NPF4 sites can be a criteria used in determining what is in/out of scope, when no decision has yet been taken by Scottish Government, who currently anticipate laying a draft in the Scottish Parliament in autumn 2021, with a final version being adopted in spring/summer 2022. This does not align with the STPR2 timeline.</b></p> <p><b>The lack of alignment between Phase 1 and 2 and Ayrshire Growth Deal projects moving into delivery next financial year is of concern. Bellfield Interchange links the three main arterial routes the A77, A76 and A71 and is a key element of the transport infrastructure for vehicle movement between North, South and East Ayrshire including the A74(M), ports and airports and is reaching its maximum capacity. Transport Scotland have advised that while the upgrade to the Bellfield Interchange is included in Phase 2, they expect the cost of the Transport Appraisal to be funded by the Council. This runs counter to the funding mechanism for every other strategic transport project and is not acceptable, particularly in circumstances where investment would benefit at least three council areas and possibly four. Such a proposal would only be achievable if the Scottish Government were to fund the council to take forward the scheme.</b></p> |
| 17 |                                                                                      | Please provide any other comments on the Case for Change element of STPR2?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |