

**EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL**

**CENTRAL LOCAL PLANNING COMMITTEE: 30 MAY 2003**

**02/0755/LB: PROPOSED REPLACEMENT OF BARGE BOARDS, SOFFITS,  
ORNAMENTAL RAFTER EXTENSIONS, GUTTERS AND DOWNPIPES  
AT 6 GRANGE TERRACE, KILMARNOCK  
BY MR D MORGAN**

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY SHEET**

**1. DEVELOPMENT DESCRIPTION**

1.1 Listed Building Consent is sought for the replacement of barge boards, soffits, ornamental rafter extensions, gutters and downpipes for the entire house. The proposed barge boards, soffits and ornamental rafter extensions, the gutters and down pipes on the rear elevation are to be PVC. The gutters and downpipes on the front elevation would be aluminium. All gutters will be white in colour and all downpipes, would be black or stone coloured.

**2. RECOMMENDATION**

**2.1 It is recommended that the application should be approved subject to the conditions indicated on the attached sheet.**

**3. CONCLUSIONS**

3.1 As is indicated at Section 5 of the report the application is in accordance with the Adopted East Ayrshire Local Plan and therefore given the terms of Sections 25 and 37(2) of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 the application should be approved unless material considerations indicate.

3.2 As is indicated in Section 6 of the report, there are material considerations relevant to this application and these are not generally supportive of the proposed development. The amenity bodies and Historic Scotland have expressed reservations regarding the use of PVC on the barge boards, soffits and ornamental rafter extensions, however it is considered that if a high quality PVC material is used, it would be difficult to distinguish between the use of PVC as difficult to distinguish between the use of PVC as opposed to timber from the street level. The use of aluminium gutters and downpipes on the front elevation is acceptable as this is the principal elevation and of architectural importance. The use of PVC gutters and downpipes on the rear elevation is acceptable as it

is not readily visible to the public and has less architectural merit. Therefore the proposed development accords with the Adopted East Ayrshire Local Plan as the development will not detract from the character and architectural qualities of the building. Therefore the negative comments of the amenity bodies do not justify a recommendation of refusal for the proposed development.

### **CONTRARY DECISION NOTE**

Should the Committee agree that the application be refused, contrary to the recommendation of the Head of Planning and Building Control the application will not require to be referred to the Development Services Committee because there would be no significant breach of policy.

**Alan Neish**  
**Head of Planning and Building Control**

**Note: This document combines key sections of the associated report for quick reference and should not in itself be considered as having been the basis for recommendation preparation or decision making by the Planning Authority.**

## EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL

CENTRAL LOCAL PLANNING COMMITTEE: 30 MAY 2003

**02/0755/LB: PROPOSED REPLACEMENT OF BARGE BOARDS, SOFFITS,  
ORNAMENTAL RAFTER EXTENSIONS, GUTTERS AND DOWNPIPES  
AT 6 GRANGE TERRACE, KILMARNOCK  
BY MR D MORGAN**

**Report by Head of Planning and Building Control**

### 1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 The purpose of this report is to present for determination a Listed Building Application which is to be considered by the Local Planning Committee under the scheme of delegation as it is subject to an objection.

### 2. APPLICATION DETAILS

2.1 **Site Description:** The application site is a detached two storey blonde sandstone villa, with a feature castellated porch on the main elevation to Grange Terrace. The property is listed, Category C(S). The existing rainwater goods are cast iron, painted a dark red. The existing barge boards and soffits are wooden painted dark red.

2.2 **Proposed Development:** Listed Building Consent is sought for the replacement of barge boards, soffits, ornamental rafter extensions, gutters and downpipes for the entire house. The proposed barge boards, soffits and ornamental rafter extensions, the gutters and down pipes on the rear elevation are to be PVC. The gutters and downpipes on the front elevation would be aluminium. All gutters will be white in colour and all downpipes, would be black or stone coloured.

### 3. CONSULTATIONS AND ISSUES RAISED

3.1 Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland have withdrawn an earlier objection and accept a compromise may be possible regarding the use of non-traditional materials on the Listed Building. As the rear is secluded, they accept the use of UPVC and the aluminium gutters and downpipes in a suitable colour. However the barge boards and rafter ends being an important decorative feature are integral to the character and are worth the long term investment that only timber could give.

***It is considered that the use of PVC on the barge boards, soffits, ornamental rafter extensions will not detract from the overall design and appearance of the listed building. If high quality PVC material is used, it would be difficult to distinguish between timber and PVC from the street. The use of PVC gutters and downpipes is also proposed on the rear elevation and as they are on the rear elevation they are not readily visible for public view and are considered acceptable. Discussions have taken place with the applicant and as a compromise the applicant has agreed the use of aluminium gutters and downpipes on the front elevation. As this is the principal elevation and wholly visible to the public it is considered that this is acceptable as it will enhance the appearance of this listed building.***

3.2 Historic Scotland have advised through informal comments that they regard the use of traditional materials to repair a listed building as being important in maintaining the quality of the building's overall fabric. They recommend the traditional approach as it is tried and tested in terms of durability and maintenance requirements.

***See response to 3.1.***

3.3 Scottish Civic Trust accept the proposals for the gutters and downpipes, but object to the proposed use of UPVC based materials for the other repairs to the listed building. The Trust are concerned about the proposed replacement of the rafter extensions, the compatibility of the plastic materials with the wooden rafters to which they will be attached, and in particular the joint in between. This is a listed building one of only two of its type and standard in the immediate area and they believe that every effort should be made to retain the qualities of its original detailing and that its original materials should be maintained where possible from both an aesthetic and structural point of view. They recommend that quality, natural materials be used for the repairs. The Trust accept the proposals for the gutters and downpipes.

***See response to 3.1.***

3.4 Grange Howard Community Council have not responded to their consultation letter at the time of writing this report.

***Noted.***

#### **4. REPRESENTATIONS**

4.1 There is one letter of objection to the proposed development from the Scottish Civic Trust which is detailed in Section 3 of the report.

## **5. ASSESSMENT AGAINST DEVELOPMENT PLAN**

5.1 Sections 25 and 37(2) of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 require that planning applications be determined in accordance with the development plan unless material consideration indicate otherwise. For the purposes of this application the development plan comprises the Adopted East Ayrshire Local Plan and the approved Ayrshire Joint Structure Plan.

5.2 The proposal should be considered against Policy ENV 4 of the Adopted East Ayrshire Local Plan which states that the Council will seek to ensure that development affecting the appearance or setting of a Listed Building should be sympathetic in terms of its layout, size, scale, design, siting, materials and colour of finish. Whenever possible all proposals should seek to preserve, enhance or incorporate features, which contribute positively to the character or appearance of the area and have due regard to the architectural and historic qualities of the area or building concerned.

***It is considered that the proposals, subject to conditions, can be consistent with Policy ENV 4.***

5.3 Policy ENV 7 requires that development should comply with the Council's Design Guidance. In relation to rainwater goods on Category C(S) listed buildings, the Design Guidance states that replacement rainwater goods in non-traditional materials exactly replicating the original in terms of style, design and finish may be considered acceptable.

***It is considered that the use of PVC will not have a detrimental impact on the character and appearance of the listed building. The applicant is proposing the use of aluminium gutters and downpipes on the front elevation of the building which will preserve and enhance the architectural quality of the front of this listed building. Where PVC is proposed, it is essential that it is of high quality and it matches the design and style of the original features.***

## **6. ASSESSMENT AGAINST OTHER MATERIAL CONSIDERATIONS**

6.1 The principal material considerations relevant to the determination of the application are the Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas and consultations and representations as detailed in Sections 3 and 4 of the report.

## Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas

6.2 The Memorandum states in many buildings broad eaves and decorated barge boards, valances and pendants are the most distinctive feature of the design. Such items should always be retained, repaired or reinstated. In respect of external rainwater plumbing the Memorandum says that they are an integral part of the overall design. Such features should always be retained, or replaced with items which match the originals exactly in all respects. The use of undecorated modern replacements would considerably affect the quality of the building and should not be permitted.

***See response to 5.3.***

## **7. FINANCIAL AND LEGAL IMPLICATIONS**

7.1 There are no financial or legal implications for the Council in the determination of this application.

## **8. CONCLUSIONS**

8.1 As is indicated at Section 5 of the report the application is in accordance with the Adopted East Ayrshire Local Plan and therefore given the terms of Sections 25 and 37(2) of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 the application should be approved unless material considerations indicate.

8.2 As is indicated in Section 6 of the report, there are material considerations relevant to this application and these are not generally supportive of the proposed development. The amenity bodies and Historic Scotland have expressed reservations regarding the use of PVC on the barge boards, soffits and ornamental rafter extensions, however it is considered that if a high quality PVC material is used, it would be difficult to distinguish between the use of PVC as opposed to timber from the street level. The use of aluminium gutters and downpipes on the front elevation is acceptable as this is the principal elevation and of architectural importance. The use of PVC gutters and downpipes on the rear elevation is acceptable as it is not readily visible to the public and has less architectural merit. Therefore the proposed development accords with the Adopted East Ayrshire Local Plan as the development will not detract from the character and architectural qualities of the building. Therefore the negative comments of the amenity bodies do not justify a recommendation of refusal for the proposed development.

## **9. RECOMMENDATION**

**9.1 It is recommended that the application should be approved subject to the conditions indicated on the attached sheet.**

### **CONTRARY DECISION NOTE**

Should the Committee agree that the application be refused, contrary to the recommendation of the Head of Planning and Building Control the application will not require to be referred to the Development Services Committee because there would be no significant breach of policy.

**Alan Neish**  
**Head of Planning and Building Control**

21 May 2003  
(AG/MMM)

FV/DVM

### **LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS**

1. Application Form and Plans.
2. Statutory Notices.
3. Consultation Replies.
4. Adopted East Ayrshire Local Plan.
5. Approved Ayrshire Joint Structure Plan.
6. Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas.

Anyone wishing to inspect the above papers please contact Ailsa Graham on 01563 576787.

***Implementation Officer: Dave Morris***

020755LB

## EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL

## TOWN &amp; COUNTRY PLANNING (SCOTLAND) ACT 1997

02/0755/LB

---

Site of Proposal: Viewbank  
6 Grange Terrace  
KILMARNOCK

Nature of Proposal: Proposed Replacement of Barge Boards,  
Soffits, Ornamental Rafter Extensions, Gutters  
and Downpipes

Name & Address of Applicant: Mr Donald Morgan  
Viewbank  
6 Grange Terrace  
KILMARNOCK KA1 2JR

Name & Address of Agent:

---

DPOs Reference: AG/MMM

The above LISTED BUILDING application should be granted subject to the following conditions:-

1. The proposed development shall be carried out in accordance with the application form and plans received on 26 September 2002 and the letter received by the Planning Authority on 21 April 2003.

REASON To ensure that the development is carried out in accordance with the approved details.

2. Notwithstanding the details submitted, the barge boards, soffits and rafter extensions shall be constructed in a high quality PVC material with a matt finish. Details/samples of the material to be used and its final colour shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority before any development commences on the site and thereafter implemented according to the approved details.

REASON In the interests of the architectural quality and character of this listed building.

3. Notwithstanding the details submitted, the rainwater goods on the front elevation shall be formed in aluminium and details of their colour shall be submitted for approval by the Planning Authority before any development commences and thereafter implemented according to the approved details.

REASON REASON In the interests of the architectural quality and character of this listed building.

**DUE TO ORDNANCE SURVEY REGULATIONS AND COPYRIGHT  
THE MAP IS AVAILABLE FOR VIEWING AT THE COUNCIL'S  
PLANNING OFFICE IN KILMARNOCK. FOR INFORMATION ON  
VIEWING PLEASE CONTACT (01563) 576790.**