

**EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL**

**CORPORATE GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF MEETING HELD ON THURSDAY 29 SEPTEMBER 2005 AT 1000 HOURS IN THE MEETING ROOM, COUNCIL HEADQUARTERS, LONDON ROAD, KILMARNOCK**

**PRESENT:** Councillors Knapp, O'Neill, Reeves, D Coffey, Cree, Weir, McIntyre, Finlayson, McDill, Jackson, Farrell, Menzies, Crawford, Ross, Dinwoodie and Carmichael.

**ATTENDING:** Fiona Lees, Chief Executive; Elizabeth Morton, Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support; David Mitchell, Head of Administrative and Legal Services; Martin Rose, Head of Personnel; Colin Houston, Chief Auditor; and Gillian Hamilton, Administrative Officer.

**APOLOGIES:** Councillors Stephanie Young, Douglas Reid, Iain Linton, Ray Murray and George Smith.

**CHAIR:** Councillor John Knapp, Chair.

**CHAIR'S REMARKS**

1. The Chair intimated that Item 20, New Farm Loch Local Office, was withdrawn from the Agenda.

**MINUTES**

**SUB-COMMITTEE MINUTES**

2. There were submitted and approved both as a correct record and in respect of the recommendations contained therein the undernoted Sub-Committee Minutes (circulated), viz:-
  - 2.1 **CHAIR'S SUB-COMMITTEE OF THE CORPORATE GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE OF 9 AND 23 JUNE 2005 (APPENDICES I and II)**
  - 2.2 **APPEALS SUB-COMMITTEE OF THE CORPORATE GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE OF 30 JUNE AND 1 JULY 2005 (APPENDICES III and IV).**

**RISK AND AUDIT SCRUTINY GROUP**

3. There were submitted for information and noted Minutes of the Risk and Audit Scrutiny Group meeting held on 13 June 2005 (circulated).

**PERFORMANCE REVIEW GROUP**

4. There were submitted for information and noted Minutes of the Performance Review Group meeting held on 16 June 2005 (circulated).

**CHAIRS' MONITORING GROUP**

5. There were submitted for information and noted Minutes of the Chairs' Monitoring Group meetings held on 23 June and 15 September 2005 (circulated)

**CENTRAL JOINT CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE**

6. There were submitted for information and noted Minutes of the Central Joint Consultative Committee held on 2 June and 15 September 2005 (circulated).

**GOVERNANCE MATTERS**

**A JOB WORTH DOING – UPDATE REPORT (Item 4, Page 1116, 03/07)**

7. There was submitted a report dated 22 September 2005 (circulated) by the Chief Auditor which provided an update on progress against the action points arising from the Audit Scotland follow up study on internal audit services, details of which were reported to Corporate Governance Committee on 16 November 2004.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to note the progress against the developments in the audit arrangements arising from the “A Job Worth Doing” study;
- (ii) to note that Internal Audit recently carried out an EFQM assessment using the Quality Scotland Pathway tool, and that an improvement action plan was developed which, when implemented, would contribute to the process of continuous improvement of the audit service; and
- (iii) otherwise, to note the report.

**STATUTORY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS FOR 2004/05**

8. There was submitted a report dated 1 September 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support which presented the outcome for the 2004/05 Statutory Performance Indicators (SPI's) in respect of those indicators for which the Committee had an interest.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to note and consider the performance of the Council in 2004/05 against the Statutory Performance Indicators in which it had an interest as detailed in the appendix to the report; and
- (ii) otherwise, to note the report.

**DEPARTMENT OF CORPORATE SUPPORT BEST VALUE PROGRESS (Item 4, Page 1278, 03/07)**

9. There was submitted a report dated 21 September 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support which advised on progress made by the Department of Corporate Support in the implementation of the European Foundation for Quality Management Excellence Model (EFQM) and in the Department's programme for Best Value Review.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to note the progress made in the Department of Corporate Support's implementation of EFQM and in its agreed programme for Best Value Review;
- (ii) to endorse the Department's consolidated EFQM Action Plan appended to the report;

- (iii) to note that further reports providing detailed recommendations on individual Best Value Reviews would be brought to future committees in accordance with the agreed programme; and
- (iv) otherwise to note the report.

### **OTHER BUSINESS**

#### **CoSLA – SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE JOINT STAFFING WATCH RETURN AT 11 JUNE 2005**

- 10.** There was submitted a report dated 19 July 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support which advised on the number of employees employed by the Council as at 11 June 2005, reported to CoSLA as required under the Joint Staffing Watch arrangements.
- It was agreed:-
- (i) to note an amendment to paragraph 3.3 of the report to reflect an increase of 34 on the June 2004 full-time equivalent of 5468 employees; and
  - (ii) otherwise, to note the contents of the report.

#### **EMPLOYEE ATTITUDE SURVEY (Item 10, Page 1549, 03/07)**

- 11.** There was submitted a report dated 22 September 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support which advised on the findings of the Employee Attitude Survey which was carried out within the Council during June 2005.
- It was agreed:-
- (i) to invite Tom McGlew, of the University of Edinburgh, to a future meeting to give a presentation on the findings of the Employee Attitude Survey;
  - (ii) to receive an update in 6 months time, on progress with publicising the findings of the survey and production of an action plan to take forward issues raised; and
  - (iii) otherwise, to note the contents of the report.

#### **SALARY SACRIFICE – EMPLOYEE BENEFITS SCHEME**

- 12.** There was submitted a report dated 27 July 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support which recommended the introduction for all employees within the Council of a Salary Sacrifice Employee Benefits Scheme in relation to the Home Computer Initiative and Child Care vouchers.
- It was agreed:-
- (i) to approve the adoption of a Salary Sacrifice Employee Benefits Scheme in relation to the Home Computer Initiative and Child Care vouchers, subject to consultation with trade unions;
  - (ii) to authorise the Head of Personnel to introduce further Salary Sacrifice Initiatives as they arose in the future; and
  - (v) otherwise to note the report.

### **EXCLUSION OF PRESS AND PUBLIC**

13. The Committee resolved that under Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, as amended, the Press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that they involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraphs 1 and/or 11 of Schedule 7A of the Act.

### **STAFFING**

#### **SINGLE STATUS UPDATE (Item 12, Page 1118, 03/07)**

14. There was submitted a report dated 20 September 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support which (i) provided an update on progress in implementing the Single Status agreement with particular reference to the Job Evaluation Scheme; and (ii) advised on receipt of a Collective Equal Pay Grievance Claim from the GMB Trade Union in respect of a number of their members employed in various departments within East Ayrshire Council.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to remit the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support to contact the representatives of the GMB Trade Union to discuss the possibility of entering into negotiated settlement prior to a Grievance Hearing being convened under the Council's Grievance Procedure; and
- (ii) otherwise to note the report.

#### **COMMUNITY PLANNING AND PARTNERSHIP UNIT – OPERATIONAL STAFF REVIEW (Item 13, Page 821, 03/07)**

15. There was submitted a report dated 22 September 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support which sought approval to update and amend the staffing structure of the Community Planning and Partnership Unit of the Department of Corporate Support.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to approve the staffing proposals contained in section 3 of the report, subject to consultation with trade unions;
- (ii) that the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support report back to a future meeting of the Committee, with options and proposals for the future mix of temporary/permanent positions in the Unit; and
- (iii) otherwise to note the report.

#### **PROPOSAL TO RESTRUCTURE THE IT SERVICE WITHIN THE CORPORATE SUPPORT DEPARTMENT**

16. There was submitted a report dated 30 August 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support which sought approval to implement a limited restructure of the IT Services function within the Department of Corporate Support.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to approve the regrading and restructuring proposals contained in the report, subject to consultation with trade unions; and
- (ii) otherwise, to note the report.

**DEPARTMENT OF CORPORATE SUPPORT – ESTABLISHMENT OF POST OF  
POLICY OFFICER (EQUALITIES AND DIVERSITY)**

17. There was submitted a report dated 25 July 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support which sought approval for the establishment of a post of Policy Officer (Equalities and Diversity) within Personnel Services.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to approve the establishment of a post of Policy Officer (Equalities and Diversity) within Personnel Services, subject to consultation with trade unions; and
- (ii) otherwise, to note the report.

**COMMUNITY LEARNING AND DEVELOPMENT (Item 19, Page 823, 03/07)**

18. There was submitted a joint report dated 5 September 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support and the Executive Director of Educational and Social Services which sought approval of amendments to the staffing structure and to extend the contracts of existing employees on externally funded posts within the Community Learning and Development and Early Years Sections of the Department of Educational and Social Services, subject to consultation with Trade Unions.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to approve the staffing proposals contained in paragraph 3 of the report, subject to consultation with trade unions; and
- (ii) otherwise, to note the report.

**IMPLEMENTATION OF BEST VALUE REVIEW ON LOOKED AFTER AND  
ACCOMMODATED CHILDREN (Item 5, Page 956, 03/07)**

19. There was submitted a joint report dated 4 July 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support and the Executive Director of Educational and Social Services which sought approval for amendments to the staffing structure within the Social Work Service of the Department of Educational and Social Services.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to approve the staffing proposals contained in paragraph 5 of the report; and
- (ii) otherwise, to note the report.

**RESTRUCTURE OF THE COMMUNITY RECREATION SERVICE (Item 13, Page  
1297, 03/07)**

20. There was submitted a joint report dated 30 August 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support and the Executive Director

of Neighbourhood Services which sought approval for a restructure of the Community Recreation Service within the Department of Neighbourhood Services, subject to consultation with trade unions.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to approve the staffing proposals contained in paragraph 3.1 of the report, subject to consultation with trade unions; and
- (ii) otherwise, to note the report.

#### **TREE RISK MANAGEMENT INSPECTIONS**

- 21.** There was submitted a joint report dated 31 August 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support and the Executive Director of Neighbourhood Services which sought approval for amendments to the staffing structure within the Outdoor Amenities Service of the Department of Neighbourhood Services, subject to consultation with trade unions.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to approve the staffing proposals contained in paragraph 3 of the report, subject to consultation with trade unions; and
- (ii) otherwise, to note the report.

#### **HOMELESSNESS STRATEGY (Item 8, Page 1489, 03/07)**

- 22.** There was submitted a joint report dated 7 September 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support and the Executive Director of Neighbourhood Services which sought approval for the continuation of the temporary posts of Homeless Persons Officer and Senior Clerical Assistant within Housing Services of the Department of Neighbourhood Services, subject to consultation with trade unions.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to approve the staffing proposals contained in paragraph 3 of the report, subject to consultation with trade unions; and
- (ii) otherwise, to note the report.

The meeting terminated at 1054 hours.

**APPENDIX I**

**EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL**

**CHAIR'S SUB-COMMITTEE OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF MEETING HELD ON THURSDAY 9 JUNE 2005 AT 0945 HOURS IN  
THE MEETING ROOM, COUNCIL HEADQUARTERS, LONDON ROAD,  
KILMARNOCK**

**PRESENT:** Councillors John Knapp and William Crawford.

**ATTENDING:** Elizabeth Morton, Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support; George Park, Employee Relations Manager; and Gillian Hamilton, Administrative Officer.

**CHAIR:** Councillor John Knapp, Chair.

**EXCLUSION OF PRESS AND PUBLIC**

1. The Sub-Committee resolved that under Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, as amended, the Press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraph 1 of Schedule 7A of the Act.

**REQUEST FOR VOLUNTARY SEVERANCE**

2. There was submitted a report dated 6 June 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support which sought approval of a request for early retirement received from an employee within the On-Site Services Section of the Department of Educational and Social Services.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to approve the early retirement application detailed in Appendix A of the report; and
- (ii) otherwise, to note the contents of the report.

The meeting terminated at 0946 hours.

**APPENDIX II**

**EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL**

**CHAIR'S SUB-COMMITTEE OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF MEETING HELD ON THURSDAY 23 JUNE 2005 AT 0930 HOURS IN  
MEETING ROOM 2, COUNCIL HEADQUARTERS, LONDON ROAD,  
KILMARNOCK**

**PRESENT:** Councillors John Knapp and Drew McIntyre.

**ATTENDING:** Fiona Lees, Chief Executive; Elizabeth Morton, Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support; Alex McPhee, Executive Head of Finance; George Park, Employee Relations Manager; and Gillian Hamilton, Administrative Officer.

**CHAIR:** Councillor John Knapp, Chair.

**EXCLUSION OF PRESS AND PUBLIC**

1. The Sub-Committee resolved that under Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, as amended, the Press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraph 1 of Schedule 7A of the Act.

**REQUESTS FOR VOLUNTARY SEVERANCE**

2. There was submitted a report dated 21 June 2005 (circulated) by the Depute Chief Executive/Executive Director of Corporate Support which sought approval of a request for early retirement received from four employees within the Department of Corporate Support.

It was agreed:-

- (i) to approve the early retirement applications detailed in Appendix A of the report; and
- (ii) otherwise, to note the contents of the report.

The meeting terminated at 0946 hours.

**APPENDIX III**

**EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL**

**APPEALS SUB-COMMITTEE OF THE CORPORATE GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF MEETING HELD ON THURSDAY 30 JUNE 2005 AT 1400 HRS  
IN THE MEETING ROOM, COUNCIL HEADQUARTERS,  
LONDON ROAD, KILMARNOCK**

**PRESENT:** Councillors Tommy Farrell, Brian Reeves, Gordon Cree, Robert McDill and William Menzies.

**ATTENDING:** Martin Rose, Head of Personnel; and Anne Marie Carr, Senior Administrative Officer.

**CHAIR:** Councillor Tommy Farrell, Chair.

**EXCLUSION OF PRESS AND PUBLIC**

1. The Sub-Committee resolved that under Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, as amended, the Press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph 1 of Schedule 7A of the Act.

**GRIEVANCE APPEAL NO G1/2005**

2. There was submitted the notification of grievance appeal form by the appellant together with submissions by the Department of Neighbourhood Services (all circulated).

**2.1 OUTCOME OF APPEAL**

Having heard both parties, the Sub-Committee agreed, by majority, that the grounds of the Grievance Appeal had not been substantiated and the appeal was not upheld.

The meeting terminated at 1445 hrs,

**APPENDIX IV**

**EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL**

**APPEALS SUB-COMMITTEE OF THE CORPORATE GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF MEETING HELD ON FRIDAY 1 JULY 2005 AT 0930 HRS  
IN THE MEETING ROOM, COUNCIL HEADQUARTERS,  
LONDON ROAD, KILMARNOCK**

**PRESENT:** Councillors John Knapp, Gordon Cree, Robert McDill and Elaine Dinwoodie.

**ATTENDING:** George Park, Employee Relations Manager; and Jennifer Morrison, Administrative Officer.

**CHAIR:** Councillor John Knapp, Chair.

**EXCLUSION OF PRESS AND PUBLIC**

1. The Sub-Committee resolved that under Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, as amended, the Press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph 1 of Schedule 7A of the Act.

**DISCIPLINARY APPEAL NO D2/05**

2. There was submitted a copy of the Disciplinary Appeals procedure together with submissions by the Department and Notification of Appeal form and submissions by the appellant (all circulated).

**OUTCOME OF APPEAL**

3. Having heard both parties, the Sub-Committee unanimously agreed that the grounds of the appeal had not been substantiated and the appeal was not upheld.

Following the intimation of the above decision, the appellant's representative queried the appellant's dismissal without notice and it was agreed that the Head of Personnel would investigate and respond to the appellant's representative.

The meeting terminated at 1110 hrs.