EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL

PLANNING COMMITTEE: 27-JUNE-2014

14/0131/PP AND 14/0241/LB: PROPOSED SINGLE STOREY EXTENSION TO EXISTING PRIMARY SCHOOL.
AT: HURLFORD PRIMARY SCHOOL, 1 UNION STREET, HURLFORD, KILMARNOCK
BY: EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL

Report by Head of Planning and Economic Development

Click for Application Details http://eplanning.east-ayrshire.gov.uk/online/applicationDetails.do?activeTab=summary&keyVal=N14ZK5GF01U00

Click for Application Details http://eplanning.east-ayrshire.gov.uk/online/applicationDetails.do?activeTab=summary&keyVal=N2D7LPGF20000

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY SHEET

1. DEVELOPMENT DESCRIPTION

1.1 The proposal seeks planning permission and listed building consent for the erection of a single storey extension to the primary school building to accommodate a new dining and kitchen area for the school.

1.2 The extension will be located predominately along the eastern elevation of the building, and partly on the northern elevation. The proposed single storey extension will incorporate a flat roof design so as to protect existing architectural features of the B listed building as well as minimising the overall bulk and scale of the extension.

1.3 Externally the extension will be finished in waterstruck coal fired bricks to reflect the colour of the existing red ashlar of the B listed building. External glazing has been designed and proportioned to reflect the vertical elements and proportions of the existing windows of the primary school building. The flat roof of the extension will incorporate barrelled roof lights to provide natural lighting, and ornamental screening will be incorporated to conceal ventilation plant equipment.
2. RECOMMENDATION

2.1 It is recommended that the application for Planning Permission ref. 14/0131/PP should be approved subject to the conditions on the sheet attached to this committee report.

2.1.1 It is recommended that the application for listed building consent application ref. 14/0241/LB should be approved subject to the conditions on the sheet attached to this committee report but that prior to any decision being issued the application be referred to Historic Scotland under the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas (Scotland) Act 1997.

3. CONCLUSIONS

3.1 As indicated in Section 5 of the report the development proposal complies with the Development Plan and will not detract from the amenity and visual appearance of the category B listed building.

3.2 The primary material considerations in this case generally focus on the consultation responses, the SHEP and the impact on amenity. The proposal will not detract from the character and special interest of the B listed building, and there will be no adverse impacts on the surrounding properties. The proposed extension recognises and preserves the character of the listed building, whilst at the same time improving and enhancing the facilities at the primary school.

CONTRARY DECISION NOTE

Should the Committee agree that the application be refused contrary to the recommendation of the Head of Planning and Economic Development in terms of the principle of the proposed development, then the application will not require to be referred to Council as it would not represent a significant departure from Council policy.

Alan Neish
Head of Planning and Economic Development

Note: This document combines key sections of the associated report for quick reference and should not in itself be considered as having been the basis for recommendation preparation or decision making by the Planning Authority.
1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 The purpose of this report is to present for determination an application for planning permission and an application for listed building consent, which are to be considered by the Planning Committee under the scheme of delegation as the Council has an ownership interest in the application site and is also the applicant.

2. APPLICATION DETAILS

2.1 Site Description: The application site comprises a predominately two storey and three storey category B listed primary school building located on the north-eastern corner of the junction with Union Street and Academy Street within Hurlford. The red ashlar primary school building is set within a walled playground, with wrought-iron gates and railings. The building is Free Renaissance in style with slate roof and mainly original windows. There is one modern adjunct in red brick (boiler house).

2.2 The application site is bounded to the west, south and east by residential properties, whilst to the north is a car park and hardstand area fronting Riccarton Road.

2.3 Proposed Development: The proposal seeks planning permission and listed building consent for the erection of a single storey extension to the primary school building to accommodate a new dining and kitchen area for the school.

2.4 The extension will be located predominately along the eastern elevation of the building, and partly on the northern elevation. The proposed single storey extension will incorporate a flat roof design so as to protect existing architectural features of the B listed building as well as minimising the overall bulk and scale of the extension.

2.5 Externally the extension will be finished in waterstruck coal fired bricks to reflect the colour of the existing red ashlar of the B listed building. External
Glazing has been designed and proportioned to reflect the vertical elements and proportions of the existing windows of the primary school building. The flat roof of the extension will incorporate barrelled roof lights to provide natural lighting, and ornamental screening will be incorporated to conceal ventilation plant equipment.

3. CONSULTATIONS AND ISSUES RAISED

3.1 Historic Scotland – has no objections and advised that they are content with the proposed single storey extension to accommodate kitchen and dining facilities to Hurlford Primary. They will require to be satisfied that your Council has considered the European Protected species regulations in line with Scottish Government policy. This will require a bat survey to be undertaken and made available to Historic Scotland to enable us to determine the application.

A Bat Survey Report was undertaken by East Ayrshire Leisure Countryside Team, and was forwarded to Historic Scotland in an email dated 13/06/2013. The report concluded that “We found no conclusive evidence of bats roosting in the school building”, and the proposed “building works will have no impact on the potential population of bats within the area”. The Bat Survey Report will be referred to Historic Scotland for their assessment prior to any decision being released if Members choose to grant consent.

3.2 Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland – The Society is pleased to see this handsome building still in use as a school. We have no objection to the modest extension that will facilitate continuity. We suggest however, that because of the open aspect of the building attention to detail is vital. Materials and finishes should be traditional. We would also like to see some references in the windows and doors of the extension to the design and proportion of those that will be obscured by the changes.

It is considered that the materials proposed for the extension are satisfactory and will not detract from the character or historic qualities of the listed building. The windows and doors of the extension have been designed to reflect the proportions of the original building.

3.3 Hurlford and Crookedholm Community Council – no consultation response received at the time of writing this report.

3.4 Roads and Transportation – No objection, subject to condition stating that any gates must open inward away from the public footway

The above comments can be incorporated as conditions on any consent granted.
3.5 East Ayrshire Access Panel North District - Concerns regarding accessibility to the existing school.

The listed building is split on different levels and existing access within parts of the building is restrictive. This matter will be addressed in the Building Warrant application under the Building Scotland Act.

4. REPRESENTATIONS

4.1 The listed building application was advertised in the Kilmarnock Standard and Edinburgh Gazette on 28/03/2014 and 30/05/2014, whilst the planning application was neighbour notified on 10/03/2014 and 23/05/2014. No representations have been received in connection with either the listed building application or the planning application.

5. ASSESSMENT AGAINST DEVELOPMENT PLAN

5.1 Sections 25 and 37 (2) of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 require that planning applications are determined in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. For the purposes of this application the development plan comprises the Adopted East Ayrshire Local Plan 2010 (EALP).

5.2 In addition, under the terms of Section 59 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997, the Council is required to have special regard to the desirability of preserving listed buildings or their setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which they possess.

5.3 Strategic Policy ENV1 states that the Council will seek to protect, preserve and enhance all built heritage resources requiring conservation including Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas, together with their respective settings, Historic Gardens and Designed Landscapes, Scheduled Ancient Monuments and Archaeological and Industrial Archaeological Sites and Landscapes.

The proposal complies with Strategic Policy ENV1 as the proposed single storey extension will result in the continued preservation and enhancement of the category B listed building. The proposal represents a sensitive extension to the listed building and will not harm the overall special interest of the building. The proposal generally respects the original layout and form of the original building and will not result in the loss of important historic fabric which contributes to the buildings special interest. The ‘modern’ design of the proposed extension, its overall scale and massing is considered acceptable and will not detract from the B listed building.
5.4 Policy ENV4 states that the Council will actively encourage the retention, restoration, renovation and re-use of listed buildings, unlisted buildings in conservation areas and other locally important, especially traditional older properties, throughout the area. Development affecting a listed building or its setting shall preserve the building, or its setting, or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. The layout, design, materials, scale, siting and use of any development shall be appropriate to the character and appearance of the listed building and its setting.

The proposal involves the erection of a single storey extension which seeks to improve the amenity and function of the primary school itself. The proposal will not detract from the listed building or detract from its setting. The design of the extension, the materials proposed, the scale and siting are all considered appropriate to the character and appearance of the listed building. The proposal has been designed so as to minimise the visual impact on the listed building. Overall the proposal complies with policy ENV4.

5.5 Policy ENV9 states that the Council will actively encourage and demand the highest possible standards of design from applicants in the formulation of their development proposals. All developers will be expected to comply fully with the Council’s existing design guidance documents relating to, and advising on, the particular type of development proposed. Developments which do not meet the required design standards detailed in these documents will require to be fully justified and may not be supported by the Council.

In this instance, Design Guidance 4 for Listed Buildings and Buildings within Conservation Areas is the relevant design document which seeks to achieve the highest standards of design in East Ayrshire. The intention of the design guidance is not to restrict development, but to ensure that all development proposed is of the highest quality of design, in keeping with and sympathetic to the character and appearance of the area in which it is proposed. It is considered that the proposal complies with the relevant design guidance in that the proposal is subordinate to the original listed building due to its flat roof design. The design of the extension reflects and enhances the overall character of the listed building, and the materials proposed are deemed to be sympathetic to the listed building. The proposal complies with the policy ENV9.

5.6 Policy CS1 states that Council will respond positively to changing needs and demands for all community, educational, sporting, leisure, cultural and other facilities serving local communities throughout East Ayrshire. In particular, the Council will encourage and support the development of such new facilities as may be required and the upgrading, expansion and improvement of existing facilities to meet local needs.
The proposal will create a new dining and kitchen area which will improve and enhance the facilities at the Hurlford Primary School. The proposal therefore complies with policy CS1.

5.7 Policy PROP9 states Council will, subject to the necessary finance being available, improve and enhance existing community, educational, leisure, recreational and sporting facilities for which it is responsible, both in the area settlements and throughout the rural area. Consideration will be given to the provision of new, expanded or additional facilities where there is a demonstrated need and where finances permit.

As discussed above, the proposed extension will improve and enhance facilities at the Hurlford Primary School and result in an acceptable balance between preserving the B listed building and expansion of the primary school building. Therefore the proposal complies with policy PROP9.

6. ASSESSMENT AGAINST MATERIAL CONSIDERATIONS

6.1 The principal material considerations relevant to the determination of this application are the consultation responses, representations, the planning history and the impact on the amenity of the area.

Consultation Responses

6.2 The consultation responses received do not indicate that the application should be refused.

Representations

6.3 No representations have been received in connection with the application.

Planning History

6.4 03/0514/LB - Proposed External Works To School To Provide Aid For Visual Impairment – Approved.

Impact on amenity

6.5 The proposed extension will be partly visible from Riccarton Road, Union Street and Academy Street, however due to the single storey nature of the extension and the flat roof design it will not represent a dominant feature and will not have a detrimental impact on the amenity of the listed building. The proposal is not considered to detract from the visual amenity of the surrounding area and that of the B listed building itself. The design and materials proposed for the extension respect the character and special qualities of the building.
Scottish Historic Environment Policy (SHEP)

6.6 The SHEP advises that actions in respect of Scotland’s built environment should secure its conservation and management, there should be a presumption in favour of preservation of individual historic assets, should be managed in a sustainable way and all of Scotland’s people should be able to enjoy, appreciate and learn from Scotland’s historic environment.

On the basis that this proposal seeks to erect a single storey extension which will benefit and enhance both the Hurlford Primary School as well as ensuring that the character and special qualities of the listed building are retained, the proposal would be in compliance with the key policy aims of Scottish Ministers expressed through the SHEP.

7. FINANCIAL AND LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

7.1 There are no financial implications for the Council in the determination of the planning and listed building applications.

7.2 In terms of legal implications, although the Council owns the land in this case, there is no requirement to notify the planning application to the Scottish Government under Circular 3/2009: ‘Notification of Planning Applications’, should Members choose to grant consent.

7.3 As the listed building is Category B listed, the application for listed building consent requires to be referred to Historic Scotland prior to any decision being released if Members choose to grant consent.

8. CONCLUSIONS

8.1 As indicated in Section 5 of the report the development proposal complies with the Development Plan and will not detract from the amenity and visual appearance of the category B listed building.

8.2 The primary material considerations in this case generally focus on the consultation responses, the SHEP and the impact on amenity. The proposal will not detract from the character and special interest of the B listed building, and there will be no adverse impacts on the surrounding properties. The proposed extension recognises and preserves the character of the listed building, whilst at the same time improving and enhancing the facilities at the primary school.
9. **RECOMMENDATION**

2.2 It is recommended that the application for Planning Permission ref. 14/0131/PP should be approved subject to the conditions on the sheet attached to this committee report.

2.3 It is recommended that the application for listed building consent application ref. 14/0241/LB should be approved subject to the conditions on the sheet attached to this committee report but that prior to any decision being issued the application be referred to Historic Scotland under the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas (Scotland) Act 1997.

**CONTRARY DECISION NOTE**

Should the Committee agree that the applications be refused contrary to the recommendation of the Head of Planning and Economic Development, the applications would not require to be referred to the Council as this would not constitute a significant breach of policy.

Alan Neish  
Head of Planning & Economic Development  
19 June 2014  
FV/AN

**List of Background Papers**

1. Application forms & plans  
2. Statutory notices/certificates;  
3. Consultation responses  
4. Adopted East Ayrshire Local Plan 2010  
5. SHEP

Anyone wishing to inspect the above papers should contact Craig Thomas, Planning Officer on 01563 576772.

**Implementation Officer: David McDowall, Operations Manager**
The above application for planning permission should be approved subject to condition:

1. Details and samples of the proposed external materials for the extension shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before any development commences on the site.

   REASON: In the interests of the visual amenity of the listed building.

2. Details of the ornamental screens shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. No work shall be begun on this element of the development until written approval has been issued.

   REASON: In the interests of the visual amenity of the listed building.
3. Details of boundary fencing shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. No work shall be begun on this element of the development until written approval has been issued.

REASON: In the interests of the visual amenity of the listed building.

4. Any gates must open inward away from the public footway.

REASON: To ensure that gates do not obstruct pedestrian or vehicle movement or create a safety hazard.

**ADVISORY NOTE**

1. The applicant should consult with Council’s Environmental Health department concerning this proposal in respect of legislation administered by that Service which is likely to affect this development.

**Reason for the Decision**

The proposal is compliant with the Development Plan and the material considerations do not indicate that the application should be refused.
**TP24**

**East Ayrshire Council**

**TOWN & COUNTRY PLANNING (SCOTLAND) ACT 1997**

**Application No: 14/0241/LB**

| **Location** | Hurlford Primary School  
1 Union Street  
Hurlford  
Kilmarnock  
East Ayrshire  
KA1 5BT |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nature of Proposal:</strong></td>
<td>Proposed single storey extension accommodate kitchen and dining facilities to existing primary.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Name and Address of Applicant:** | East Ayrshire Council  
London Road Headquarters  
London Road  
Kilmarnock  
KA3 7BU |
| **Name and Address of Agent:** | Corporate Infrastructure  
Opera House  
8 John Finnie Street  
Kilmarnock  
KA1 1DD |

Officer’s Ref:  
Craig Thomas  
01563 576772

**Subject to notification to Scottish Ministers**

The above application for listed building consent should be approved subject to the following condition:

5. Details and samples of the proposed external materials for the extension shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before any development commences on the site.

**REASON:** In the interests of the visual amenity of the listed building.
6. Details of the ornamental screens shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. No work shall be begun on this element of the development until written approval has been issued.

REASON: In the interests of the visual amenity of the listed building.

7. Details of boundary fencing shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority. No work shall be begun on this element of the development until written approval has been issued.

REASON: In the interests of the visual amenity of the listed building.

8. Any gates must open inward away from the public footway.

REASON: To ensure that gates do not obstruct pedestrian or vehicle movement or create a safety hazard.

**Reason for the Decision**

The proposal is compliant with the Development Plan and the material considerations do not indicate that the application should be refused.
Title/Location  Hurlford Primary School
            Hurlford
            Application No. 14/0131/PP & 14/0241/LB

Key
Application Site

East Ayrshire Council
Department of Neighbourhood Services
Planning & Economic Development Service
The Johnnie Walker Bond
15 Strand Street
Kilmarnock KA1 1HU
Tel: (01563) 575790    Fax: (01563) 554592
E-Mail: Planning@east-ayrshire.gov.uk
Com Date: 27/06/2014

This map is reproduced from the Ordnance Survey material with permission of Ordnance Survey on behalf of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office. Crown copyright. Unauthorised reproduction infringes Crown Copyright and may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings. East Ayrshire Council 10003469.