

## **EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL**

### **GOVERNANCE & SCRUTINY COMMITTEE – 18 DECEMBER 2009**

#### **PROGRESS REPORT - INTERNAL AUDIT PLAN 2009/10**

##### **Report by the Chief Auditor**

#### **1. PURPOSE OF REPORT**

- 1.1** To submit to the Governance & Scrutiny Committee a mid year progress report on performance against the audit plan for financial year 2009/10.

#### **2. BACKGROUND**

- 2.1** In East Ayrshire Council, Internal Audit independently reports to the Chief Executive and the Governance & Scrutiny Committee.
- 2.2** The Internal Audit section operates in accordance with the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy's Code of Practice for Internal Audit in Local Government in the United Kingdom.

#### **3. PLAN ACHIEVEMENT**

- 3.1** The attached report (Appendix 1) summarises the activities of Internal Audit in the first half of the 2009/10 audit year.
- 3.2** There have been significant unplanned work demands on the section in 2009/10, arising mainly from the Building & Works investigation and relating to Internal Audit involvement in overseeing the improvement agenda and assignments on bonus and payments to contractors. I am revising the 2009/10 audit plan in light of the changed priorities and emerging risks. Details of the revisions to the plan are set out in section 4 of Appendix 1.
- 3.3** A Best Value Review of the Internal Audit service is in progress, and the review will consider future resource needs. The review is timetabled to report by 31 March 2010.

#### **4. ASSIGNMENT FINDINGS**

- 4.1** The primary purpose of Internal Audit assignment reporting is to communicate to management information that provides an independent and objective opinion on the control environment and risk exposure and prompt management to implement agreed improvement actions.

- 4.2** We have carried out a range of audit work in the year so far, and can place reasonable assurance on the core systems assignment in Payroll, and sound assurance in most areas around cash collection and procurement. The Building & Works assignments carried out in 2009 have mostly delivered a low level of assurance, and the improvement agenda in place will strengthen governance, internal control and performance in our repairs service. The improvement agenda has been substantially implemented at the time of reporting.
- 4.3** Audit reports are available to Elected Members via the Elected Member portal on the intranet. There may be circumstances where access to reports will be delayed until outstanding issues have been resolved.
- 4.4** The findings of each assignment are summarised in Appendix 1(a) of this report. Action plans have been developed in consultation with management to address all areas for improvement identified which, when implemented, will further strengthen the Council's control environment.
- 4.5** Internal Audit has undertaken follow-up work on a number of previous audit assignments, with a view to establishing progress on the implementation of audit control recommendations. This work has found that 89% of recommendations have been implemented at the time of follow-up. Most of the outstanding actions have now been implemented.

## **5. FINANCIAL/RISK/POLICY/LEGAL IMPLICATIONS**

- 5.1** This report is presented in accordance with the Council's Financial Regulations.

## **6. RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 6.1** Governance & Scrutiny is asked to note the 2009/10 mid year progress report on Internal Audit plan achievement.

Colin Houston  
**Chief Auditor**  
CH/GS1.covering report

**Dec 2009**

### **LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS**

CIPFA Code of Practice for Internal Audit in Local Government

East Ayrshire Council Financial Regulations

Anyone wishing further information on the content of this report should contact the Chief Auditor on Tel. No. (01560) 323836.

**EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL**

**INTERNAL AUDIT MID YEAR PROGRESS REPORT 2009/10**

**Report by the Chief Auditor**

**1 PURPOSE OF REPORT**

- 1.1 This report directs attention to matters of significance that have arisen out of audit work carried out in the first half of the 2009/10 audit year.
- 1.2 The annual assurance programme of work was set out in the 2009/10 Internal Audit Plan. The plan was approved by the Governance & Scrutiny Committee on 3 April 2009.

**2 INTERNAL CONTROL ENVIRONMENT**

- 2.1 In order to ensure the proper conduct of its business, the Council has a responsibility to develop and implement systems of internal control. A sound control environment will help to safeguard assets, ensure records are reliable, promote operational efficiency and ensure adherence to Council policy and procedures. Such systems of internal control can provide only reasonable and not absolute assurance against loss.
- 2.2 The control framework includes regular management information, financial regulations, standing orders, administrative procedures, management review and supervision and a system of delegation, accountability and code of conduct.
- 2.3 Internal Audit is an assurance function that provides independent and objective opinion to the Council on the control environment, by evaluating its effectiveness in achieving the organisation's objectives. We objectively examine, evaluate and report on the adequacy of the control environment as a contribution to the proper, economic, efficient and effective use of resources.
- 2.4 The Internal Audit section operates in accordance with the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy's Code of Practice for Internal Audit in Local Government in the United Kingdom. The Code defines the way in which the internal audit service should undertake its functions.

**3 AUDIT APPROACH**

- 3.1 Internal Audit's remit extends to the entire control environment of the Council. The Chief Auditor is required to deliver an annual audit opinion on the effectiveness of the control environment. The audit plan consists of a programme of assurance work designed to inform the annual opinion. Other audit work is carried out, including investigations, advisory services and performance studies, and this work may also contribute to the opinion on the control environment. Audit plans are prepared following full consultation with the Chief Executive, Executive Head of Finance & Asset Management, Executive Directors and the Corporate Management Team.

- 3.2 The primary purpose of assignment reporting is to communicate the outcomes of audit work to management, provide an independent and objective assessment on controls and risk exposure, and prompt management to implement agreed actions leading to improvement in controls and performance. The number of audit recommendations in an audit report does not necessarily influence the overall assessment. Audit recommendations are prioritised according to risk, and it is the risk associated with controls that determines the overall assessment. Audit reports are presented to the relevant Executive Director. Internal Audit routinely undertake follow-up work on all major audit assignments in order to assess progress on implementation of agreed actions.
- 3.3 As part of Internal Audit monitoring procedures, copies of all assignment reports, including follow-ups, are presented to the Chief Executive, the Executive Head of Finance & Asset Management, the Council's External Auditor and, where appropriate, to the Council Monitoring Officer. Since August 2008, audit assignment reports have been available to Elected Members through the Elected Member Portal on the Council's intranet. This development is designed to further strengthen the Council's scrutiny function.

## **4 PLAN ACHIEVEMENT**

- 4.1 Performance statistics have been collated from the audit management systems for the 2009/10 audit year. The section has issued 23 outputs at the time of reporting, and includes planned assignments, follow-up reviews and investigations. A total of 51 audit recommendations were agreed with clients covering a range of work across all services, and these, when implemented, will help to strengthen the control environment in all of the areas examined. A further 8 audit assignments are in progress at the time of reporting, and these include planned assignments, follow-ups and investigations.
- 4.2 The volume of unplanned work so far in 2009/10 has been significant. The work mostly arises from the recent Building & Works investigation findings. Audit assignments on bonus schemes and payments to contractors have been completed and assignments on standby overtime payments and support for the improvement agenda are in progress. I have adjusted the 2009/10 Audit Plan to accommodate the unplanned work. The following assignments will move to the 2010/11 Audit Plan: supply chain, security costs, electronic purchasing and self-assessment toolkits in Education and Neighbourhood Services. Revisions to the audit plan have been agreed with Executive Directors, and the External Auditor has been advised of the changes.
- 4.3 A Best Value Review of the Internal Audit service is in progress, and the review will ensure that Internal Audit is adequately staffed and resourced to enable it to meet current and future demands on the section, and contribute fully to emerging risks and changing priorities. The review will report by 31 March 2010.

## **5 ASSIGNMENT FINDINGS**

### **5.1 Overview**

- 5.1.1 The mid year report is designed to direct attention to matters of significance that have arisen out of the 2009/10 audit process. The findings arising from all audit assignments have been discussed with appropriate officers of the Council and agreed action plans, including timetables and responsibilities, have been put in place to address all identified areas for improvement.
- 5.1.2 The 2009/10 assurance programme includes assignments on the full range of audit activity, in key priority areas, including coverage of core financial systems, contracts and procurement, following the public pound and coverage of departmental systems.

5.1.3 A summary of the findings and outcomes for all completed audit assignments is presented at Appendix 1(a). The following paragraphs provide a summary of the main findings and outcomes arising from a selection of significant planned assignments. The selection covers core systems, departmental systems, computer audit, performance indicators and procurement.

## **5.2 Payroll**

5.2.1 Systems based audits continue to represent one of the main elements of planned activity. Systems reviews focus on identifying, assessing and testing the adequacy and effectiveness of controls in place to ensure the underlying objectives of the system are met.

5.2.2 Full systems reviews in Payroll and the Financial Ledger are planned for the year. The Payroll and Ledger assignments are end to end audits on core financial systems agreed with Audit Scotland.

5.2.3 Internal Audit has completed a review of four-weekly payroll. The assignment included those aspects of Payroll which are controlled and managed by Human Resources. The scope of the assignment was to examine procedures in relation to general procedural controls, processing of starters, management of deductions, adjustments to standing data, processing of leavers, examination of controls for payment processing and payment by cheque, reconciliations, and security of data. The work included interviews with relevant staff in Payroll and Human Resources, as well as the examination of supporting documentation, policies and procedures.

5.2.4 Our overall assessment is that reasonable assurance can be taken from controls operating in the payroll system within the scope of the assignment. The objectives of internal control are being met in the majority of areas, although some weaknesses have been identified.

5.2.5 An agreed action plan is in place covering a number of control improvements, including HR policies and procedures, security and retention of documentation, segregation of duties, mandates, variations to pay and employee certification arrangements.

5.2.6 The General Ledger systems review is programmed for the second half of the audit year, and the findings arising from this assignment will be included in the annual report to Governance & Scrutiny.

## **5.3 Network Access**

5.3.1 In 2008, Internal Audit conducted review of network access controls to coincide with a review of the Council's new financial ledger system. The audit report following that review was issued in September 2008, and contained seven recommendations designed to improve the control environment in that area.

5.3.2 We have now completed a follow-up review to assess the extent of implementation of those recommendations and have found that all seven recommendations have been fully implemented. The actions taken will further strengthen controls.

## **5.4 Cash Collection**

5.4.1 Internal Audit has conducted location audits at Games Halls and Golf Courses. This follows on from similar audits at Local Offices and Leisure facilities in 2007/08 and 2008/09. The audits were unannounced and the purpose was to test compliance with income and cash controls.

5.4.2 We visited three games halls and three golf courses. Our overall assessment was that sound assurance can be taken from the procedures in place in most areas within the scope of the assignments. Actions have been agreed with management which, when implemented, will further strengthen income controls in these front line services.

5.4.3 Three recommendations were raised in the July 2008 audit of Local Offices, and three recommendations were raised in the October 2008 audit of leisure facilities. We followed-up on both assignments in 2009/10 and found that all six agreed actions had been implemented.

## **5.5 Procurement**

5.5.1 Internal Audit has completed an assignment on procurement. The purpose of the assignment was to assess compliance with best practice. An assessment of compliance with best practice in procurement was carried out in 2007 using an assurance checklist developed by the Scottish Local Authorities Chief Internal Auditors' Group. The 2009 assignment is designed to assess progress made over the last two years by benchmarking current arrangements with those in place in 2007.

5.5.2 The assignment assessed the following key areas:

- accountability and governance conformance
- structure, organisation and staffing
- business processes
- compliance with EU legislation
- performance management.

5.5.3 The 2007 assurance checklist assessment scored EAC at 63% compliance, and this is compared to a national average score of 49%. The 2009 assessment for EAC scores compliance at 73%, a full 10 percentage point increase from 2007. Six of the seven control objectives show a significant increase since the 2007 review.

5.5.4 Sound assurance can be taken from the controls in place in most areas covered within the scope of this assignment. There is significant reform of procurement in progress across the public sector in Scotland, and it is evident from the results of this review that EAC is well positioned to address the procurement reform challenges, and exploit the savings opportunities available.

## **5.6 Building & Works**

5.6.1 Internal Audit is carrying out work around the Building & Works improvement agenda that flowed from the recent investigation into a range of allegations made by a Council contractor. The purpose of the improvement agenda is to bring operational and management arrangements in Building & Works into line with those in place throughout the rest of the Council. The improvement agenda addresses immediate issues and also preparations for the new merged Single Business Unit.

5.6.2 The improvement agenda covers four core areas:

- governance
- performance
- people management, and
- Single Business Unit.

5.6.3 Management has made significant progress on all four core areas set out in the improvement agenda and we are able to report that the improvement actions are substantially implemented. Internal Audit continues to work closely with management to ensure that the improvement actions are fully and effectively implemented.

5.6.4 Audit assignments on Building & Works bonus schemes and payments to contractors have been completed and the audit findings for both assignments are being considered by management. The bonus and contractor payment reports have not yet been placed in the Elected Member portal, as there are outstanding issues to resolve which an early release of the reports could prejudice. A further audit assignment on standby overtime is in progress, and the results of all of this work will be reported to Elected Members in my year end report.

## **5.7 Year-end Stockchecks**

5.7.1 Internal Audit has completed a review of the Building & Works year end stocktaking arrangements. Year-end stock counts at the Building & Works stores in Kilmarnock, Lugar and Dalmellington were attended. Our testing confirmed that the £377k stock value included in the ledger was accurate. In overall terms, we were satisfied that the arrangements conformed to the guidance issued by the Executive Head of Finance and Asset Management. Areas for improvement were identified in respect of the continuous stocktaking programme. Overall, we can take reasonable assurance from the stocktaking arrangements in place. An agreed action plan is in place covering all areas for improvement. During the 2009 audit of stocktaking arrangements, we followed-up recommendations raised during the 2008 audit. Five of the six recommendations raised in June 2008 had been fully implemented, and the remaining action has been partially implemented.

5.7.2 Internal Audit has completed a review of Roads and Transportation year end stocktaking arrangements. Year-end stock counts at Gauchalland and Underwood Roads Depots, Bonnyton street lighting store, and transport fuel stocks at Crookedholm, Underwood and Gauchalland were all visited. Our overall assessment was that sound assurance can be taken from the arrangements in place in most areas examined. An agreed action plan is in place covering all areas for improvement. Internal Audit also followed-up on recommendations raised during the 2008 audit. Out of the five recommendations issued, three had been fully implemented. The remaining two recommendations have been superseded by new recommendations.

## **5.8 Performance Indicators**

5.8.1 The overall purpose of the audit assignment is to support the External Auditors in their duty to audit the statutory performance indicators for the financial year ended 31 March 2009. For the financial year ended 31<sup>st</sup> March 2009, there are 58 indicators. East Ayrshire Council's policy is to report on all indicators.

5.8.2 Indicators within the third and fourth quartiles, and which had not recently been assessed, were selected for testing. Internal Audit selected five indicators for testing. All five indicators selected for testing required some adjustment, but were judged to be reliable after adjustment.

5.8.3 The External Auditor assessed all 58 EAC indicators to be reliable.

5.8.4 An agreed action plan is in place covering six control recommendations, including electronic data, procedural documentation and audit trails. Five recommendations were raised in the August 2008 audit of performance indicators, and these were followed-up as part of the 2009 audit work. Four agreed actions had been fully implemented and the other partially implemented.

## **5.9 Audit Follow Up**

5.9.1 Internal Audit routinely undertake follow-up work on all major audit assignments in order to assess progress on the implementation of audit recommendations arising from earlier audit work. In total, 15 audits have been followed up in the year, and these revealed that agreed audit recommendations had been substantially implemented by the time of follow-up review.

- 5.9.2 The 15 follow-ups covered 112 audit recommendations, and the auditors found that 100 agreed actions had been fully implemented by the date of the follow-up audit visit, which is a fully implemented score of 89%. Of the 12 agreed actions identified at the time of the follow-up as not yet fully implemented, 6 have since been implemented, 3 have been replaced by new recommendations and a client assurance statement is in place covering the 3 remaining actions which arise from a recently completed follow-up assignment. There are no particular concerns around the outstanding improvement actions.
- 5.9.3 Internal Audit is satisfied that there is management commitment to act where control improvement opportunities are identified, and the overall implementation score is demonstration of this commitment. Appendix 1(b) provides a listing of all audit follow-up assignments, including the implementation score for each assignment, and Appendix 1(c) provides an overall score by service including tracking of all outstanding actions.

## **5.10 Investigations**

- 5.10.1 In August 2009, an abridged version of the Internal Audit report on Glaisnock Trust was presented to Governance & Scrutiny. The purpose of the report was to provide members with information on the outcome of the audit investigation into grant payments made to Glaisnock Trust. The abridged report sets out the findings of the investigation. The full report has not been released at this time as it includes information relating to a matter that was referred to Strathclyde Police in July 2008. This relates to specific grants made under European Social Fund and EQUAL. This matter continues to be considered by Strathclyde Police. The audit report concludes that assurance can be taken that all known payments made to the Glaisnock Trust had been received and were recorded in the Trust's accounts. The report makes a number of recommendations that have been accepted by management and a full action plan is now in place to ensure that the recommended improvements are implemented. Progress against these actions will be reported to Governance & Scrutiny.
- 5.10.2 A number of incidents have been or are being investigated by Internal Audit at the time of reporting. 136 days of the 150 day investigations contingency have been used so far this year.

## **6 SUMMARY OF PERFORMANCE**

- 6.1 Internal Audit has carried out assignments in a number of areas during the first half of the audit year. These include planned assignments of payroll, cash collection, procurement, performance indicators, stores and assignments in Building & Works. Other audit work has been completed around investigations.
- 6.2 As a result of these assignments, Internal Audit has put forward a range of recommendations to address areas for improvement, covering a wide range of issues. Action plans have been developed in consultation with management to address all areas for improvement identified, which should result in continued improvement in the overall control environment.
- 6.3 Internal Audit has undertaken follow-up work on a number of previous audit assignments, with a view to establishing progress on the implementation of audit control recommendations. This work revealed that agreed actions had been substantially implemented by the time of the audit visit. Where audit recommendations have not been fully implemented the further action required has been agreed with the service.
- 6.4 Revisions to the audit plan have been agreed with Executive Directors and External Audit has been advised of the changes.

**Colin Houston**  
**Chief Auditor**

ASSIGNMENT	SCOPE OF ASSIGNMENT	ASSESSMENT/OUTCOMES
<b>Warm Deal Grant Claim (16 April 2009)</b>	The purpose of the assignment was to verify the accuracy of the information contained within the grant claim form.	The grant claim was found to be accurate.
<b>School Location Audit at Netherthird Primary School (29 April 2009)</b>	The purpose of the audit was to assess the key financial and administrative systems operated by Netherthird Primary and assess compliance with expected controls.	The overall assessment was reasonable assurance. Management action has been agreed on establishment fund arrangements, school meals income and inventories.
<b>Building &amp; Works Annual Stocktaking (28 May 2009)</b>	The purpose of the assignment was to evaluate year-end stocktaking arrangements and report any areas for improvement identified.	The overall assessment was reasonable assurance. Management action has been agreed on improvements to continuous stocktaking, stock levels and procedures.
<b>Games halls location audit (2 July 2009)</b>	The purpose of the assignment was to visit games halls, document systems and conduct regularity tests on compliance with required procedures.	The overall assessment was sound assurance. Management action has been agreed on improvements to tuck shop arrangements, vending income and management checks.
<b>Payroll audit (3 July 2009)</b>	Internal Audit has completed a review of four-weekly payroll. The assignment included those aspects of Payroll which are controlled and managed by Human Resources. The scope of the assignment was to examine procedures in relation to general procedural controls, processing of starters, management of deductions, adjustments to standing data, processing of leavers, examination of controls for payment processing and payment by cheque, reconciliations, and security of data.	The overall assessment was reasonable assurance. Management action has been agreed in a range of areas, including security of data, segregation of duties, starters, leavers and transfers and reporting.
<b>Roads &amp; Transport Annual Stocktaking (3 July 2009)</b>	The purpose of the assignment was to evaluate annual stocktaking arrangements and report any areas for improvement identified.	The overall assessment was sound assurance. Management action has been agreed on continuous stockchecking and use of weighbridge.
<b>Golf Course location audit (31 July 2009)</b>	The purpose of the assignment was to visit games halls, document systems and conduct regularity tests on compliance with required procedures.	The overall assessment was sound assurance. Management action has been agreed on chip and pin arrangements, cash floats and tuck shops.
<b>2008/09 Statutory Performance Indicators (14 August 2009)</b>	The overall purpose of the audit assignment was to support the External Auditors in their duty to audit the statutory performance indicators for the financial year ended 31 March 2009. Five indicators falling within the third and fourth quartiles for 2007/08 were selected for testing.	All five indicators required adjustment. Following these amendments, all five indicators were found to be reliable. All EAC Statutory Indicators are reported and found to be reliable.

ASSIGNMENT	SCOPE OF ASSIGNMENT	ASSESSMENT/OUTCOMES
<b>Building &amp; Works Incentive Bonus Schemes</b> <b>(21 August 2009)</b>	The purpose of the assignment was to test accuracy of bonus input and calculations, authorisation of bonus sheets, reasonableness of bonus claims and management control of bonus.	Report not yet in portal. The audit report is being considered by management. There are outstanding issues to be resolved before this report is placed in the portal.
<b>Procurement</b> <b>(14 October 2009)</b>	An assessment of compliance with best practice in procurement was carried out in 2007 using an assurance checklist developed by the Scottish Local Authorities Chief Internal Auditors' Group. The 2009 assignment is designed to assess progress made over the last two years by benchmarking current arrangements with those in place in 2007.	Sound assurance can be taken from the controls in place in most areas covered within the scope of this assignment. The 2009 assessment scored compliance at 73%, compared with 63% in 2007. Management action has been agreed on further improvements to business processes and performance management.
<b>Examination of Payments to Contractors</b> <b>(13 November 2009)</b>	Internal Audit has completed an assignment to test the accuracy and validity of payments made by Building & Works to contractors. The work involved conducting physical and technical verification of works and comparing findings to the invoices and works orders.	Report not yet in portal. The audit report is being considered by management. There are outstanding issues to be resolved before this report is placed in the portal.

**FOLLOW-UP ASSIGNMENTS 2009/10**
**APPENDIX 1(b)**

Assignment	Findings	Report Issued
<b>Follow-up of Kirkstyle Primary School audit</b> (Educational & Social Services)	11 of 12 actions fully implemented = 92% implementation. Client Assurance Statement signed.	12 May 2009
<b>Follow-up of New Farm Primary School audit</b> (Educational & Social Services)	7 of 7 actions fully implemented = 100% implementation.	15 May 2009
<b>Follow-up of Building &amp; Works Stocktaking</b> (Neighbourhood Services)	5 of 6 actions fully implemented = 83% implementation.	28 May 2009
<b>Follow-up of Roads &amp; Transportation Stocktaking</b> (Neighbourhood Services)	3 of 5 actions fully implemented = 60% implementation. Outstanding actions replaced by new recommendations.	3 July 2009
<b>Follow-up of Cash Handling in Leisure Facilities</b> (Neighbourhood Services)	3 of 3 actions fully implemented = 100% implementation.	31 July 2009
<b>Follow-up of Statutory Performance Indicators</b> (Finance Service)	4 of 5 actions fully implemented = 80% implementation. Outstanding action replaced by new recommendation.	14 August 2009
<b>Follow-up – Cash Handling Local Offices</b> (Neighbourhood Services)	3 of 3 recommendations fully implemented = 100% implementation.	3 September 2009
<b>Follow-up Non Domestic Rates</b> (Finance Service)	24 of 28 agreed actions fully implemented = 86% implementation. Client Assurance Statement signed.	4 September 2009
<b>Follow-up Energy Management</b> (Finance Service)	14 of 17 agreed actions fully implemented = 82% implementation. Client Assurance Statement signed.	22 September 2009
<b>Follow-up Network Access</b> (Corporate Support)	7 of 7 recommendations fully implemented = 100% implementation.	29 September 2009
<b>Follow-up Mileage</b> (Finance Service)	3 of 3 recommendations fully implemented = 100% implementation.	29 September 2009
<b>Follow-up Cash Advances</b> (Finance Service)	3 of 3 recommendations fully implemented = 100% implementation.	29 September 2009
<b>Follow-up of Gargieston Primary School audit</b> (Educational & Social Services)	5 of 5 recommendations fully implemented = 100% implementation.	15 October 2009
<b>Follow-up Education Maintenance Allowance</b> (Educational & Social Services)	2 of 2 recommendations fully implemented = 100% implementation.	30 October 2009
<b>Follow-up Annanhill Primary School audit</b> (Educational & Social Services)	6 of 6 recommendations fully implemented = 100% implementation.	30 October 2009

## DEPARTMENTAL SUMMARY OF 2009/10 FOLLOW-UPS

## APPENDIX 1(c)

Client Performance By Department	Assignments Conducted	Recommendations			
		Raised	Implemented	Not implemented or partly implemented	Percentage implemented
Corporate Support	1	7	7	0	100%
Finance Service	5	56	48	8	86%
E&SS	5	32	31	1	97%
Neighbourhood Services	4	17	14	3	82%
<b>All Services</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>112</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>89%</b>

## TRACKING OF OUTSTANDING RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on Departmental assurance

Dept	Assignment	Follow-up Issued	Number	Current position
Educational & Social Services	Kirkstyle Primary School audit	12 May 2009	1	Implemented.
Neighbourhood Services	Building & Works Stocktaking	28 May 2009	1	Implemented.
Neighbourhood Services	Roads & Transportation Stocktaking	3 July 2009	2	Replaced by new recommendations.
Finance Service	Performance Indicators	14 August 2009	1	Replaced by new recommendation.
Finance Service	Non Domestic Rates	4 September 2009	4	All implemented.
Finance Service	Energy Management	22 September 2009	3	Client Assurance Statement in place.
<b>TOTAL</b>			<b>12</b>	