

EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL

CABINET – 24 MARCH 2010

INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC PROVISION IN EAST AYRSHIRE

Report by Executive Director of Educational and Social Services

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To update Cabinet on the role of the Instrumental Music Service in improving educational attainment and achievement in East Ayrshire and to introduce the mechanism for a policy on charging for Instrumental Music Tuition.

2. BACKGROUND.

- 2.1 East Ayrshire Council has traditionally valued the wider personal and educational aspects of music making. The investment has recognised that music provision contributes towards the enhancement of pupil self-esteem and self-confidence along with the development of team-building and respect for others.
- 2.2 There has been extensive participation in musical performance from pupils in East Ayrshire. Over 2,500 pupils annually participate in authority-wide projects and opportunities including eight authority bands, choirs and ensembles, performance opportunities such as 'XtrAvaganza!' and 'Spring Spectacular', and curricular partnership experiences including Scottish Chamber Orchestra Masterworks, Scottish Opera, Scottish Ensemble and Drake Music Project Scotland. These activities support and enhance the curricular and extra-curricular music making, which takes place in all educational establishments throughout the academic session.
- 2.3 This diversity of opportunity has been recognised by the National Music Council of Great Britain who previously reported: 'throughout the submission there were good examples of young people's music-making being showcased in exciting and fruitful ways. In short, there is a pleasing vitality about the music education in East Ayrshire.'
- 2.4 The Instrumental Music Service works on the premise that musical performance forms only part of the educational experience for young people. The sense of teamwork involved in rehearsing and performing a composition is an educational outcome, as well as meeting the challenge of giving a public performance. Taken together, the skills and experiences gained reflect the aims of the four capacities of Curriculum for Excellence.

3. THE AIMS OF THE INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC SERVICE

3.1 East Ayrshire Council provides the opportunity for children to receive Instrumental Music tuition. Based on an agreed formula (Entitlement and Provision), the IMS provides tutors to each Learning Partnership.

3.2 The service aims to:

- Raise the musical attainment of pupils
- Support pupils in acquiring skills which will allow them to enjoy and become actively involved in a wide range of musical experiences contributing to the musical life of the school and the community
- Promote the expressive and creative ability of pupils in music through learning to play a musical instrument or singing
- Promote pupils' understanding of music in the everyday life of their own and other cultures
- Enable pupils to realise their musical potential through the playing of a musical instrument or singing
- Encourage self confidence and develop a sense of personal achievement and self expression in pupils
- Support pupils in their practical preparation for SQA examinations
- Support pupils in their preparation for and participation in Authority groups
- Support class music teachers to cover a range of curricular work outwith their own expertise.

3.3 Instrumental Service Staffing

The IMS comprises 20 members of staff (14.2 FTE) including 1.0 FTE Instrumental Music Service Manager.
8 Brass Instructors (5.4 FTE)
1 Guitar Instructor (0.4 FTE)
1 Highland Bagpipe Instructor (1.0 FTE)
1 Percussion Instructor (0.9 FTE)
3 String Instructors (FTE 1.5)
3 Voice/Piano/Keyboard Instructors (2.2 FTE)
2 Woodwind Instructors (FTE 1.8)

3.4 The annual cost of this provision is £547,750

4. SQA AND NATIONAL QUALIFICATIONS: IMPACT ON ATTAINMENT IN CURRICULAR MUSIC

4.1 A large number of pupils who receive instrumental music instruction go on to take examinations at Standard Grade, Intermediate 1 & 2, Higher and Advanced Higher. Within the National Qualifications Framework, 60% of the overall mark is made up of the performance element of the examination. The Instrumental Music Service supports Music Departments in the delivery of national examinations. In 2008/09 50% of Standard Grade, 80% of Higher and 95% of Advanced Higher pupils currently receive instrumental instruction as

part of their course. The majority of pupils gaining 'A' or Credit passes receive instrumental instruction.

5. EXTRA-CURRICULAR ACTIVITIES

- 5.1 While the Instrumental Music Service supports young people in their learning through preparing them, in partnership with secondary music departments, for success in their SCQF practical examinations the extra-curricular activities offered by the Instrumental Music Service also have a significant impact on developing a young person's life-long enjoyment of music-making.
- 5.2 Over 600 pupils regularly take part each week during lunchtimes, before the school day and after school hours in over 20 music groups. All secondary schools have Brass/Jazz/Pipe/Wind Bands and/or choirs, orchestras or ensembles. Many of these groups embark on biennial foreign concert tours and participate in National Competitions. Upwards of 150 young people from a range of schools and a variety of ensembles travel to perform in Europe during the summer break. Primary schools also enjoy a variety of extra-curricular activities including recorder groups, percussion ensembles, Samba groups and choirs.
- 5.3 These school-based groups have opportunities to perform at school concerts and functions, special authority functions e.g. the Council's Excellence Awards Ceremony, New School Openings and also at community and charity events such as Rotary and Chamber of Commerce functions and by performing in shopping centres etc for fundraising. School-based groups also participate in the annual Instrumental Music Service Gala Concert and the YMI Platform Concert.
- 5.4 Pipers are often invited to welcome delegates at conferences both local and national as well as performing at special Council events. This year pipers played at the Provost's Charity Ball and an Evening Dinner Reception for overseas visitors, East Ayrshire Excellence Awards, 10 School Burns Suppers, Mauchline Holy Fair, 2 school openings and the Tapestry Partnership Learning and Teaching Conference, which took place in the Glasgow Royal Concert Hall in November 2009.

6. PERFORMANCE OPPORTUNITIES LED BY THE INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC SERVICE

- 6.1 During the past session pupils have had the opportunity to participate in authority-wide initiatives including ten authority bands, choirs and ensembles, performance events such as Instrumental Music Service Gala Concert, Spring Spectacular, XtrAvaganza, Showcase, YMI Platform Concert and ScotFest and curricular partnership experiences including Scottish Chamber Orchestra Masterworks, ABC Kidsamonium, Philharmonia Orchestra MusicQuest, Scottish Opera Secondary Vocal Masterclasses and Drake Music Scotland projects in Special Schools and Units.

- 6.2 The Instrumental Music Service Gala Concert held in October 2009 featured almost 400 young musicians from all of the secondary schools. The programme included a wide range of styles and instruments such as Brass Bands, Pipes & Drums, Wind Bands and Ensembles, a Guitar Solo, a String Orchestra, and Vocal Ensembles.
- 6.3 The annual Spring Spectacular was held at the end of March 2010 and featured over 250 secondary school musicians performing in groups such as the Senior String Orchestra, Brass Band, Intermediate and Senior Choirs, Big Band, Pipes & Drums and a Samba Band.
- 6.4 The XtrAvaganza held at the end of March 09 featured almost 270, mainly primary school children, performing in the Primary Schools' Choir (which included 30 guest pupils from Northern Ireland and Norway), Primary Schools' String Orchestra, Samba Band, Concert Band and a Piper. This concert featured the second of two specially commissioned works reflecting The Homecoming.
- 6.5 This year's Music Summer School Programme will offer opportunities in vocal, wind band, strings, piping and primary creativity with ICT. Courses are led by instrumental tutors and visiting musicians. This year over 175 young people participated in the Music Summer Programme.

7. LIFELONG LEARNING AND COMMUNITY PATHWAYS

- 7.1 Further enhancing these extracurricular opportunities is a network of community pathways through a range of local bands, orchestras, choirs and ensembles. Many East Ayrshire young singers go on to join local groups such as Centrestage, Cumnock Amateur Musical Production Society, Loudoun Musical Society and Kilmarnock Choral Union. A recent production in the Palace Theatre of Oliver by Kilmarnock Amateur Operatic Society involved over 40 young singers from East Ayrshire.
- 7.2 There are also strong links between the Instrumental Music Service and local Brass and Concert Bands. For example, around 25% of the membership of Kilmarnock Concert Brass currently receives tuition through the East Ayrshire Instrumental Music Service (IMS), while 30% of the membership of the recently formed Stewarton Community Concert Band received their formative tuition through the IMS. Many woodwind, brass and percussion players also go on to join Dalmellington Silver Band, Dunaskin Doon Silver Band and the Cumnock based Ayrshire Clarinet Choir. The connections with local Pipe Bands are equally strong with many players becoming adult members of bands such as Muirkirk & District and Cumnock & District Pipe Bands when they leave school. String players take the opportunity to join the Ayrshire Fiddle Orchestra and Ayrshire Symphony Orchestra.
- 7.3 Some players progress to represent East Ayrshire in Regional and National Groups such as The West of Scotland Schools' Symphony Orchestra and Concert Band and the National Youth Orchestra and National Brass Band of Scotland. A recent success story records that a Double Bass player from

Cumnock Academy, who began learning in Primary 5, has progressed through the various stages of learning and performing to be accepted this year to study at the Royal Scottish Academy of Music and Drama.

8. HOW THE SERVICE IS PERFORMING

- 8.1 Music developments in East Ayrshire were featured in the summer 2009 issue of the Scottish Arts Council Youth Music Initiative Magazine. The work also appeared on SAC and EAC websites. Colleagues were invited to present at the forthcoming Scottish Association of Music Educators National Conference in Stirling University in September.
- 8.2 This year the Stewarton Academy Concert Band once again enjoyed success at the British Association of Symphonic Brass and Wind Ensembles final at the Royal Welsh College of Music, Cardiff where the band gained a Gold Award. In November 2009 the Cumnock Academy Brass Band won the Senior Section at the Scottish Brass Band Champions in Perth.
- 8.3 Following Honourable Mentions in 2003 and 2004, East Ayrshire was one of only eight Local Authorities UK wide to receive the prestigious Diploma of Merit from the National Music Council of Great Britain in 2005. East Ayrshire was the only Scottish local authority to receive a Diploma of Merit. In 2006 East Ayrshire received the top award - The Major Award, shared with Southampton, and was presented at a ceremony at the Royal Society for the Arts London during December. In 2007 and 2008 the Council once again received Diplomas of Merit.
- 8.4 For a record fifth consecutive year, East Ayrshire was recognised by the National Music Council of Great Britain and was awarded the prestigious Diploma of Merit at the Annual Local Education Authority Music Awards Ceremony, which took place in London on Monday 9 November 2009. This award recognised the range and quality of music opportunities offered to young people.

9. CHARGING FOR INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC TUITION

- 9.1 During the consultation period on the 2009-2010 budget, there was recognition that the principle of charging in the present economic climate was appropriate. Respondents were keen however that the initial proposition of a £10 charge per lesson be reviewed and the cost reduced. This Report has taken cognisance of the request and the maximum charge per lesson, as indicated below, will not exceed £5.00 per individual lesson with a reduced fee for a group lesson.
- 9.2 1094 pupils currently receive lessons through the Instrumental Music Service in East Ayrshire. It is estimated that 504 (47%) of pupils currently receiving tuition will be entitled to free lessons with the remaining 590 (53%) eligible for charges. If the proposal, as outlined below, which recommends the first year

of lessons free of charge for a new recruit is accepted, then the numbers eligible for charging would be:

- 504 pupils eligible for free lessons through SQA and concessions
- 107 pupils receive free lessons as a result of the “first year free” policy
- 483 pupils would be invoiced.

9.3 Position on charging and level of charges in East Ayrshire’s Comparator Local Authorities.

AUTHORITY	CHARGES
Clackmannanshire Council	SQA pupils free Primary pupils free for one year and then £200 in 3 instalments
East Renfrewshire Council	£100 per annum
Inverclyde Council	£87.50 per annum (In S1 & 2/ S3-6 if not SQA)
North Ayrshire Council	No charge as yet, although considering charges for 2011/12
South Ayrshire Council	No charge as yet, although reviewing staffing levels.
West Lothian Council	No charge as yet, although reviewing for 2011/12

10. MANAGING CHARGES IN EAST AYRSHIRE

- 10.1 The Council has adopted Audit Scotland’s ‘Challenge of Charging’ as its main guide to charging policy. The checklist, which is integral to this policy, has been completed by the Instrumental Music Service Manager. The aim of the checklist is to ensure a consistent approach to setting charges and adherence to Council policies while ensuring that the work that goes in to developing charges is properly recorded and evidenced.
- 10.2 Taking account of the Council’s wish to reduce the lesson charge from £10 to £5 per lesson, while also recognising the risk factors relating to the possible initial drop-off of tuition referred to Section 11 below, an annual charge of £150 for a minimum of 30 individual lessons per academic session is recommended from August 2010. Group lessons will be charged at £100 for the equivalent number of lessons. Lessons will be delivered in group and individual settings appropriate to the age and stage of the pupils. Pupils taking lessons for the first time will receive the first year of lessons free of charge, irrespective of the qualifying criteria.
- 10.3 Families with more than one child receiving instruction will be supported through the second sibling receiving a 50% percent discount with the third and subsequent siblings receiving free tuition.

- 10.4 The procedures as described in 10.2 and 10.3 will meet the required income targets of £31,800 for the period 16 August 2010 to 31 March 2011 and £50,040 over a full academic session. It is not possible to exactly forecast at this stage any 'drop off' rate in participation as a result of charging. If 'drop off' is minimal, the charging, as outlined, may result in a small surplus balance once the budget target has been covered.
- 10.5 Access to local authority instruments, which will require a continued support of school and authority bands, orchestras and ensembles, will remain free of charge. However, parents/guardians may be encouraged to purchase/lease an instrument as their child progresses. This will in turn release instruments, enabling an increased number of pupils to participate.
- 10.6 Experience of other authorities indicates that a working model of dealing with invoicing and the collection of charges is directly through the Department Finance Section with the Instrumental Music Service Manager liaising with a member of the Finance Team. Initial analysis suggests that the most effective way of collecting charges is either through one lump sum or by setting up a direct debit mandate, both prior to the commencement of lessons at the start of term. One authority has established a 'credit card' scheme for payment which will also be explored. The final model agreed will aim to be as flexible for parents as possible. For example, it will aim to ensure that if lessons are missed as a result of pupil or staff illness then there will be no cost to the parents. In addition, the system will explore possibilities of setting up a 'discretionary' provision to waive charges in exceptional circumstances.
- 10.7 Discussion between the Instrumental Music Service Manager and the Finance Department will be required in order to finalise the mechanism for requesting and receiving payments. This would include, for example, the agreed production of initial letters to parents requesting payment, assessing where lessons are to be free and the required action to be taken where fees have not been received or lessons stop, and communication to staff regarding which pupils have / have not paid. Appropriate and effective communication with parents will be central to the implementation process. This would come in the form of a leaflet supported by a series of information sessions.

11 RISK FACTORS

- 11.1 It is possible that, as fees are introduced, the demand remains the same while the constituency for that demand changes. In other words, the same numbers of pupils apply to have instruction, but the socio-economic mix of the group changes.
(Source: What's Going On? Youth Music Audit commissioned by the Scottish Arts Council and Musicians Union.)
- 11.2 Some Music Services that have introduced charges noticed at least some of the following impact.
- An initial drop off rate of up to 40% of young people taking lessons.

- Music tuition uptake increasing in affluent areas and decreasing in areas of deprivation.
- School and Authority music groups identify an initial drop in pupil numbers.
- Conflict between free lessons delivered through the Youth Music Initiative (YMI) and paid lessons through the IMS in primary schools.

11.3 The proposed model of charging has been designed to mitigate the possible negative implications of 11.2. For example, any young person whose family receive income support will not be subject to a charge. Parents who have more than one child receiving tuition will not pay more than a maximum of £7.50 per lesson, irrespective of the number of their children receiving lessons. 47% of the present contingent of pupils will continue to have free lessons. In addition, all those beginning lessons for the first time will have the first year free of charge.

12. CONSULTATION

12.1 The proposal to introduce charging was introduced as part of the Department of Educational and Social Services 2009/10 budget deliberations. This was then consulted upon, alongside a wide range of other proposals, during the extensive budget consultative process, coordinated as a whole Council exercise, during December and January. At these sessions a wide range of community representatives, including parents, teachers and senior pupils had an opportunity to comment upon the recommendation to introduce charging for music instruction. The general view which emerged was that the principle of charging was acceptable in the present economic climate, but the level of charging should reduce from the proposed £10 per lesson. This was factored into the charging recommendations as outlined in Section 10 of this report.

13. POLICY/LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

13.1 A new policy on charging for access to the Instrumental Music Service will require to be finalised.

13.2 In order to ensure a consistent approach to setting charges and adherence to Council policies, the Guidance within Audit Scotland's 'Challenge of Charging' will be followed.

14. RECOMMENDATIONS

14.1 Cabinet is asked to:

- (i) note the wide ranging quality activities in which the Instrumental Music Service are employed;
- (ii) note the cost of delivery of the music instrumental service in East Ayrshire;
- (iii) approve the recommended charging structure;
- (iv) otherwise, note the contents of this report.

GRAHAM SHORT
Executive Director of Educational and Social Services

JW/AS
8/3/10

Background Papers

Nil

Members wishing further information should contact Graham Short, Executive Director of Educational and Social Services, Tel: (01563) 576017 or Andrew Sutherland, Tel: (01563) 576126.

Implementation Officer: John Wilson